

**VICTORIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

**Thursday April 10, 2014
6:15 p.m.**

50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: Aaron Borchers, Marc Conte, Jack Decker, Fritz Harding (6:20pm), Jeffery Hissem.

Commissioners Absent: Alfred Berthold.

HPO Staff Present: James Goodman.

- I.** CALL TO ORDER – 6:16pm.
- II.** NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Thursday, May 1, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room A.
- III.** NEXT COMMISSION HEARING –Thursday, May 8, 2014.
- IV.** APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Thursday, March 13, 2014. MOTION: Decker/Borchers (4-0-0) APPROVED.
- V.** PUBLIC FORUM
- VI.** SWEAR IN STAFF
- VII.** STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII.** STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS
- IX.** APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

1. 14-3-9

765 North High Street

Matt DeLeon (Applicant)

Approve application #14-3-9, 765 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install new 12sqft sign with LED perimeter lighting.
- All holes for new bracket are to be located in mortar joints only.

MOTION: Decker/Harding (5-0-0) APPROVED.

NEW APPLICATIONS

2. 14-4-17

1060 Neil Avenue

Matthew Teetor (Owner)

Approve application #14-4-17, 1060 Neil Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Replace unsafe railing with new wooden baluster railing.
- The original railing was loose and presented a safety hazard.
- Install new revised traditionally constructed railing (top rail, bottom rail, square balusters) similar to properties across Neil Avenue.
- New measured drawing to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review by Architectural Sub Committee.

MOTION: Harding/Hissem (4-0-1) APPROVED. [Decker Abstained]

3. 14-4-18

17 Buttles Avenue

Malika De Silva (Applicant)

Short North Partners, LLC (Owner)

Approve application #14-4-18, 17 Buttles Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install new patio seating to Kingmakers, a board game parlor, per the submitted drawings.
- Contingent upon approval by the City of Columbus Department of Public Service.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (5-0-0) APPROVED.

4. 14-4-19

1047 Highland Street

Hope Restoration (Applicant)

Jason & Paige Henry (Owners)

Approve application #14-4-9, 1047 Highland Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Repair/rebuild the existing front porch.
- Approved new design to maintain the historic fluted columns, and to have a traditionally constructed railing with either turned or square balusters.
- Measured drawings/details to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review by Architectural Sub Committee.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (5-0-0) APPROVED.

5. 14-4-20

661 Dennison Avenue

Nicole & Rhett Ricart (Owners)

After presentation by the Applicant and discussion by the Victorian Village Commission, Application # 17-4-20 was divided into items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of review and the following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded:

Approve application #14-4-20a, 661 Dennison Avenue, as submitted:

- Removal seven (7) existing trees from the site per the recommendation of arborist report.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (5-0-0) APPROVED.

Continue application #14-4-20b, 661 Dennison Avenue, to allow the applicant time to submit additional information:

- Install landscape plantings, water feature, fireplace, and new walkways.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners indicated concerns with the amount of landscaping elements and proposed work in the yard. The previously approved wraparound porch creates a large amount of exterior space.
- In proposing work in the side yard, obscuring the yard and large items such as a fireplace/chimney could be problematic. Additional privacy should be achievable, but the goal should not be to totally obscure the house.
- Detailed elevations showing plantings and hardscape elements, measured siteplans, and specific information regarding the proposed fireplace and water feature are required for review at a future Victorian Village Commission meeting.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW APPLICATIONS

6. 14-4-21

82 Price Avenue

Shremshock Architects (Applicant)

Burwell Investments, LLC (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Construct 2-story wood-frame carriage house with cementitious siding, aluminum clad windows, and asphalt shingle roof.
- The first floor of the carriage house would serve as the garage for the existing units, and the proposed second floor living units.
- Current zoning is ARLD (17.4 units per acre), with the additional units the site would be 32 units per acre.
- The proposal would request consideration of variances for density and maneuvering (stacked parking).

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- The Commission indicated that the overall massing is too large and that an exterior stairway and balcony are not appropriate.
- The overall depth of the building is too much. One vehicle length would be better and the Commission would possibly support an enlarged/deep apron for additional parking.

- The current roof design and dormers should be re-evaluated. The existing Italianate home should be referenced in the carriage house design.

7. **14-4-22**

40-42 West Third Avenue

Berardi + Partners (Applicant)

SND Partners, LLC (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Demolition of existing single-story commercial addition located at 40 West Third Avenue and creation of green space with portions of the existing parking to remain.
- Exterior rehabilitation of the existing Italianate residence single-family residence at 42 West Third Avenue.
- The site area resulting from the demolition and a portion of the north parking lot will be adapted to space for a new 3+ story structure.
- The west portion of the existing parking lot will provide 10 parking spaces.
- Construct new 3+ story on the east portion of the property. The structure is being designed as a “bar building” with a north/south orientation parallel to the alley.
- The building will include a total of 16 units, with 3 dwelling units at grade, 7 units of the 2nd floor, and 6 townhouses on the 3rd floor with portions of the 4th floor.
- The proposed 4th floor will be recessed from the façade to minimize apparent height and massing from grade.
- The building will additionally supply 9 interior garage spaces accessed from the alley.
- Preliminary zoning information is supplied on drawing ‘Sheet A01’.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Following the presentation by the applicant, Chair Conte called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slips received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Katherine Reidel 50 W. Third Ave.	Has concerns with the project. Does not believe the style of the design is appropriate for the area. The proposed density of the project would negatively affect parking and safety. The project would create parking problems in the area.

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Decker – The Commission uses City Code 3116:12 Standards for New Construction to evaluate new buildings, particularly how new buildings relate to surrounding contributing properties. Significant progress has been made with the design. Still is not sure that a building of that size could fit on the site, but the new orientation is good.
- Commissioner Conte – The new orientation of the project on the site is very good. New construction should look new, but also needs to be able to fit within the existing context. Suggested that vertical orientation of the windows could be helpful with the project “fitting in”. Asked about the Third Avenue entrance and if a step or stoop might be possible.
- Commissioner Borchers – Great progress has been made on the design. The recessed area of the fourth floor doesn’t seem to be working to reduce the apparent height on Third Avenue. Brick or block would be better materials more in keeping with the surrounding area and should be considered.
- Commissioner Hissem – The project has come a long way and is greatly improved. Agrees with the comments of other Commissioners.
- Commissioner Harding – The new design of the structure is good, and the scale and massing address the existing urban condition of the site. The use of masonry, brick or block, would be better than the currently proposed siding. Believes that the new design mitigates the conditions between single-family houses and the commercial properties. The inclusion of a streetscape rendering in future reviews would be very helpful.

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

8. 14-4-23

213 Wilber Avenue

Charles Lagarce (Owner)

Recommend approval of variance application #14-4-23, 213 Wilber Avenue, as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

Variance Recommendation Request

- CC3332.38 (G) - to allow a detached garage (carriage house) to contain habitable space.
- CC3332.38 (F) – To increase the amount of lot area from 720-sqft to 816-sqft.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (3-0-1) RECOMMEND APPROVAL. [Borchers Abstained]

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

• 14-4-1

322 Wilber Avenue

Jeff Terwin (Owner)

Approve Application #14-4-1, 322 Wilber Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new Larson fullview storm door (Signature Series); color to be “Hunter Green” with “Brass” hardware.

Install New Storm Door

- Install new fullview storm door on rental office door.
- All work to be per cut sheet submitted to Historic Preservation Office.

• 14-4-2

997 Delaware Avenue

Jason Huddleston & Rob Maurer (Owners)

Approve Application #14-4-2, 997 Delaware Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repaint residence to match existing. Body to be Dulux Paints “Heritage Home Blue” (#1396), trim to be Dulux Paints “White Bucks” (#493).

Exterior Painting

- Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

• 14-4-3

724 Park Street

J. Lawrence Hutta (Owner)

Approve Application #14-4-3, 724 Park Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new Andersen fullview storm door (HD 3500 Series); color to be “Sandstone” with “Brushed Metal” hardware.

Install New Storm Door

- Install new fullview storm door on rental office door.
- All work to be per cut sheet submitted to Historic Preservation Office.

- **14-4-4**

791-793 North High Street

Taste Hospitality Group (Applicant)

Wood Companies, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application #14-4-4, 791-793 North High Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Renew COA#10-6-24e-ii, 791-793 North High Street, exactly as previously approved for a period of one (1) year. Expired: 7-21-11.

Approve Application #10-6-24e-ii, 791-793 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- *Installation of High Street elevation window system (nano wall) within the existing dimensions of the current fenestration.*
- *The High Street nano-wall panels can become single-panes that slide, and two (2) additional panels on each side may also slide (5ft).*
- *Installation of Hubbard Avenue elevation window system as submitted.*
- *Revised designs to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of Certificate of Appropriateness.*

MOTION: Brownstein/Berthold (4-3-0) APPROVED. [Berthold, Conte, Decker]

- **14-4-5**

990 Neil Avenue

Greg Ghirardi (Owner)

Approve Application #14-4-5, 990 Neil Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing wood privacy fence from side yard.
- Install new 6' wood privacy fence in side yard per submitted siteplan.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install new 6' wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **14-4-6**

52 West Russell Street (Victorian Gate Condominium)

Mode Architects (Applicant)

Marcus Pohlmann Properties, LLC

Approve Application #14-4-6, 52 West Russell Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing aluminum windows from six (6) window openings (*10 units total*).
- Install new Pella "Impervia" composite windows in existing openings to match existing profiles and color per submitted specifications.
- Install new Andersen fullview storm door (HD 3500 Series); color to be "Sandstone" with "Brushed Metal" hardware.

Install New Storm Door

- Install new fullview storm door on entry door.
- All work to be per cut sheet submitted to Historic Preservation Office.

- **14-4-7**

55 Victorian Gate Way (Victorian Gate Condominium)

Approve Application #14-4-7, 55 Victorian Gate Way, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing aluminum windows from five (5) window openings (*9 units total*).
- Install new Pella "Impervia" composite windows in existing openings to match existing profiles and color per submitted specifications.
- Install new Andersen fullview storm door (HD 3500 Series); color to be "Sandstone" with "Brushed Metal" hardware.

Install New Storm Door

- Install new fullview storm door on entry door.
- All work to be per cut sheet submitted to Historic Preservation Office.

• **14-4-8**

62 West Lincoln Street (Victorian Gate Condominium)

Mode Architects (Applicant)

Marcus Pohlmann Properties, LLC

Approve Application #14-4-8, 62 West Lincoln Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing aluminum windows from two (2) window openings (*5 units total*).
- Install new Pella “Impervia” composite windows in existing openings to match existing profiles and color per submitted specifications.
- Install new Andersen fullview storm door (HD 3500 Series); color to be “Sandstone” with “Brushed Metal” hardware.

Install New Storm Door

- Install new fullview storm door on entry door.
- All work to be per cut sheet submitted to Historic Preservation Office.

• **14-4-9**

76 West Starr Avenue

Arrow Roofing & Siding (Applicant)

Gareth Jones (Owner)

Approve Application #14-4-9, 76 West Starr Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair box gutters as needed to match existing and per submitted specifications.
- Replace existing 5” on front porch to match existing.

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• **14-4-10**

234 West First Avenue

Ohio Exteriors (Applicant)

Karl Koon (Owner)

Approve Application #14-4-10, 234 West First Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing asphalt shingle roof on house.
- Install new GAF “Royal Sovereign” standard 3Tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be “Nickel Gray”.
- Install new metal ridge roll, flashing, and valleys; color to be “Red”.
- Replace vented soffits as needed to match existing.
- Replace gutters and downspouts to as needed to match existing.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the garage roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.

- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Shingle to be GAF “Royal Sovereign” standard 3Tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be “Nickel Gray”.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• **14-4-11**

142 Price Avenue

Ryan Forrey (Owner)

Approve Application #14-4-11, 142 Price Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove four (4) deteriorated non-historic casement windows located on the front and rear elevations.
- Install new Pella casement windows sized exactly to fit the existing openings and per submitted specifications.

Replace Deteriorated/ Non-Historic Windows

- Replace two (2) deteriorated/non-historic windows on the front elevation and two (2) deteriorated/non-historic windows on the rear elevation per City Staff determination.
- Install new casement windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings; and per the submitted cutsheets and specifications.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

• **14-4-12**

1016 Hunter Avenue

Proformance Fields and Landscape, LLC (Applicant)

Gregg Dodd (Owner)

Approve Application #14-4-12, 1016 Hunter Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new permeable paver patio in rear yard per submitted siteplan and specifications.
- Install new 16’ x 16’ pergola per submitted siteplan, drawings, and specifications.

• **14-4-13**

126 Price Avenue

Apco Industries, Inc. (Applicant)

Tom Peponis (Owner)

Approve Application #14-4-13, 126 Price Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove two (2) deteriorated non-historic casement windows located on the front elevation.
- Install new Marvin casement windows sized exactly to fit the existing openings and per submitted specifications.
- Remove damaged doorjamb and deteriorated steel entry doors (2 total); install new Milliken full-view entry doors per submitted specifications.
- Install new Provia fullview storm doors per submitted specifications (2 total).

Replace Deteriorated/ Non-Historic Windows

- Replace two (2) deteriorated/non-historic windows on the front elevation per City Staff determination.

- Install new casement windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings; and per the submitted cutsheets and specifications.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

Install New Storm Door

- Install new fullview storm door on entry doors.
- All work to be per cut sheet submitted to Historic Preservation Office.

- **14-4-14**

1183 Highland Street

Jared Cauffield (Owner)

Approve Application #14-4-14, 1183 Highland Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint residence: main body or house and garage to be Benjamin Moore “Kingsport Gray” (HC-86); trim, doors, porch, and windows to be Benjamin Moore “Revere Pewter” (HC-172), main doors to be Benjamin Moore “Clinton Brown” (HC-67).

Exterior Painting

- Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

- **14-4-15**

1105 Highland Street

Richard Wires (Applicant)

Carol Winans (Owner)

Approve Application #14-4-15, 1105 Highland Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing deteriorated hinged patio door and replace to match existing.
- New door to be Provia hinged patio door per submitted specifications.

- **14-4-16**

30 West Fourth Avenue

Nancy C. Friedman (Owner)

Approve Application #14-4-16, 30 West Fourth Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove all existing deteriorated windows.
- Install new all-wood interior/exterior double hung windows sized exactly to fit the existing openings and to match existing.
- New units to be to be Marvin double-hung wood windows per submitted specifications.

Replace Deteriorated Windows

- Replace all deteriorated windows on all elevations per City Staff determination.

- Install new, 1-OVER-1, all-wood, interior/exterior, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

The Victorian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (4-0-0) APPROVED.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURNMENT – Decker/Borchers (5-0-0) ADJOURNED. 7:50 pm.