

**VICTORIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

Thursday December 11, 2014

6:15 p.m.

50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: Alfred Berthold, Aaron Borchers, Marc Conte, Lisl Kotheimer, Jack Decker (6:18pm),
Jeffery Hissem (6:22pm).

HPO Staff Present: Randy Black.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:15pm.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Thursday, December 30, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room ‘A’.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING –Thursday, January 8, 2014.
- IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Thursday, November 13, 2014. MOTION: Berthold/Borchers (4-0-0) APPROVED.
- V. PUBLIC FORUM
- VI. SWEAR IN STAFF
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS—MOTION: Berthold/Borchers (4-0-0) ACCEPTED INTO THE PERMANENT RECORD (see below)
- VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

1. 14-12-3a

1221 Highland St.

Able Roof, LLC (Applicant) Max Benjamin (Owner)

Following the H. P. O. Staff Report and subsequent discussion with the Applicant and commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #14-12-3a, 1221 Highland Street, to allow additional time for conditions assessment and direct the Applicant to remove some of the non-original, asphalt shingle siding to assess the condition of the original wood siding in one or more locations. Direct the Historic Preservation Office staff to place Application 14-12-3a on the January 8, 2015 regular meeting agenda as a Holdover for further consideration.

MOTION: Decker/Berthold (5-0-0) CONTINUED.

2. 14-12-4

1027 Neil Ave.

Outdoor Space Design (Applicant) Brian & Alison LeRoy (Owners)

Following the H. P. O. Staff Report and subsequent discussion with the Applicant, Owner, and commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-12-4, 1072 Neil Avenue, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Landscaping

- Remove existing stamped concrete path.
- Install new dry laid bluestone path.
- Install new plantings per submitted siteplan.
- Install new sandstone retaining wall. The new retaining wall will return back into the existing grade (i.e. 90 degree return) on both outside corners and on both sides of the public steps.

MOTION: Decker/Berthold (6-0-0) APPROVED.

3. 14-12-5

217-219 Wilber Ave.

Mary Raysa (Owner)

Following the H. P. O. Staff Report and subsequent discussion with the Owner and commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-12-5, 217-19 Wilber Avenue, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Remove Garage & Install Parking Pad

- Demolish existing garage.
- Install new section of parking pad to existing parking pad.
- **The new concrete pad is to be twenty feet deep (20' D), finished with an architectural finish applied with a power wash to resemble limestone with saw-cut joints. The applicant also has the option to define each parking space with brick paver inlays.**

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (5-0-1) [Borchers] APPROVED.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW APPLICATIONS

4. 14-12-6

1055 North High Street

Jonathan Barnes Architecture & Design (Applicant)

The Stonehenge Co. (Owner)

Following the Staff Report, the Applicant presented the project proposals conceptually for discussion:

Conceptual Review

- Demolition of a non-contributing 1-story office building.
- Construction an approximately 35,000-sqft mixed-use apartment development.
- The development will consist of 32 apartments on floors 2-6, a residential lobby, retail space, and a parking garage on the ground level.
- The project will be 4 stories tall on the residential side and 6 stories tall on the High Street side.

Following the presentation by the applicant, Chair Conte called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slips received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Mark Alderman 72 W Second Ave.	The "iconic design should have a Victorian twist." Recommends review of the former Chittenden Hotel (Columbus) and the Chelsea Hotel (NYC). Needs a more Victorian flair. Voiced concern with parking solutions.

The Commissioners present made comments, some of which are as noted:

Commissioner Hissem—This is a very interesting design solution. Going in the right direction and the streetscape is clear now.

Commissioner Kotheimer—Excited to hear that progress has been made with the parking solutions. The parking lease agreement would be useful to see. Cited the CGIS Building at Harvard is a good example of a successful use of terra cotta. "Definitely a good direction." The commercial quality mesh is an improvement.

Commissioner Conte—The architecture is moving in the right direction. The materials and the window framing is appropriate. Voiced concern regarding the storefront entry treatment. Also voiced concern with long-term durability and cleanliness of the mesh components. Recommends removing one of the residential floors (i.e. 2, 3, or 4) and full size parking spaces. Clarity on parking from City Zoning

Commissioner Decker—The terra cotta and mesh are "great strides in the right direction". Does not agree with the H. P. O. that the proposed design meets the guidelines for new construction. Supports the idea of trying something different but wants to make sure that its effect on parking has been

thoroughly examined to “give it the best opportunity to work”. Voice support for the garage treatment.

Commissioner Berthold—Clarified that there are now thirty-five (35) units in the building. No issue with the parking. The terra cotta is fine.

Commissioner Borchers—A lot of progress now shown. A straight-on view into the courtyard would be helpful. Voiced concern with the garage treatment. A new site plan is needed to clarify the review. Landscaping could help with the garage elevation.

NO ACTION TAKEN

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

- **14-12-1**

201-203 W. First Ave.

Gunzelman Architecture + Interiors (Applicant)

Terry & Mary Finneran (Owners)

Approve Application #14-12-1, 201-203 W. First Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair soffit as needed to match existing.
- Repair gutters as needed to match existing.
- Paint residence: body to be Sherwin Williams “Pewter Tankard” (SW0023), trim to be Sherwin Williams “Extra White” (SW7006), accent to be Sherwin Williams “Porpoise” (SW0047).

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Eave, Soffit & Fascia Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **14-12-2**

316 W. First Ave.

Whitney Truthan Poma (Owner)

Approve Application #14-12-2, 316 W. First Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair/replace deteriorated siding as needed to match existing per submitted specifications.
- Repair/replace porch floor as needed to match existing
- Repair porch columns as needed to match existing.
- Excavate and install new porch footers as needed per submitted specifications.
- Repair/replace damaged porch trim as needed to match existing.
- Repair/replace porch ceiling.
- Remove existing porch skirt and install new porch skirt.
- Paint residence: body to be Sherwin Williams "Hazel" (SW6471), trim to be Sherwin Williams "Antique White" (SW6119), accent to be Sherwin Williams "Denim" (SW6523).

Repair/Replace Wood Siding

- Repair/replace all wood siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.

Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new 1" x 3" tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Restore the front porch banisters/hand rails/columns as necessary with like material of exact same dimension and profile as the existing, original, front porch banisters/hand rails/columns; like-for-like

Replace Porch Ceiling

- Remove and dispose of existing porch ceiling, pull all nails from, and inspect condition of, existing rafters to insure structural integrity.
- Install a new porch ceiling nailed with galvanized finish nails.
- New material to be [] 1" x 3", tongue and groove, yellow pine, bead board or [] 4' x 8' Georgia-Pacific "Classic" style Ply-Bead (with sanded surface and 1/8" beaded pattern approx. 1.6" o.c.); prime exposed surface complete.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **14-12-3b**

- **1221 Highland St.**

- **Able Roof, LLC (Applicant)**

- **Max Benjamin (Owner)**

- *Application #14-12-3 has been divided into item 'a' for Victorian Village Commission review under New Business (see above), and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items.*

- Approve Application #14-12-3b, 1221 Highland St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair approximately 25-ft of 5" aluminum gutters on garage to match existing, including downspouts.

The Victorian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Berthold/Kotheimer (4-0-0) APPROVED.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURNMENT –Decker/ Berthold (6-0-0) ADJOURNED. 7:39 pm.