

**VICTORIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

**Thursday February 13, 2014
6:16 p.m.**

50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: Aaron Borchers, Marc Conte, Jack Decker, Fritz Harding (6:20pm), Jeffery Hissem.

Commissioners Absent: Alfred Berthold, Sarah Bongiorno.

HPO Staff Present: James Goodman.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:15pm.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Thursday, March 6, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room A.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING –Thursday, March 13, 2014.
- IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Thursday, January 9, 2014. MOTION: Borchers/Hissem (4-0-0) APPROVED.
- V. PUBLIC FORUM
- VI. SWEAR IN STAFF
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

1. 12-2-2b

111 West Third Avenue (Aston Place Apartments)

Meyers Architects (Applicant)

Snyder Barker Investments, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application #12-2-2b, 111 West Third Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Courtyard design and landscaping specifications for 59-unit apartment building.
- The approval is based on the location of the courtyard being on the top of a parking deck.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (5-0-0) APPROVED.

NEW APPLICATIONS

2. 14-2-7

736 Neil Avenue

Atty. Joseph S. Streb (Applicant)

Keylight Co., Ltd. (Owner)

Approve Application #14-2-7, 736 Neil Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Installation of new 6-ft wood privacy fence and associated metal railing.
- Fence to be installed along existing property line.
- The metal railing portion of the fence is to be changed to a series of three (3) 4ft-tall metal bollards.
- The applicant has until the property-line dispute is clarified to implement the design changes.
- Revised details are to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of a certificate of appropriateness.

MOTION: Hissem/Decker (5-0-0) APPROVED.

3. 14-2-8

771A North High Street

MA-Architects (Applicant)

CMH Midtown Properties, LLC (Owner)

Recommend approval of variance application #14-2-8, 771A North High Street, as submitted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- CC3312.49: Minimum number of parking spaces required - reduce the required number of spaces from nine (9) spaces to zero (0) spaces.

MOTION: Decker/Borchers (4-1-0) RECOMMEND APPROVAL. [Conte]

4. 14-2-9

951 North High Street

GRA+D Architects (Applicant)

Wood Companies (Owner)

Approve Application #14-2-9, 951 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Installation of new paver patio.
- Creation of new low screen wall for better separation from parking area.
- Installation of new planters at west edge of patio.
- Installation of new tables, bench-style seating, and table lights (lighting to be only directed onto table tops).
- Installation of new tree wells at the east side of the patio.
- Installation of new landscape material including ground cover and trees.
- Installation of new landscape lighting and patio umbrellas.
- Addition of new door on north elevation of building; door to be created by modifying an existing storefront window bay.
- Partial reuse of existing steel fence as illustrated.
- The patio area is wholly contained on private property and does not affect public right-of-way.

MOTION: Decker/Harding (4-1-0) APPROVED. [Hissem]

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW APPLICATIONS

5. 14-2-10

889 Dennison Avenue

Mark & Christina Demetry (Owners)

Conceptual Review

- Demolish the majority of existing rear addition.
- Construct new rear addition that is 5-ft wider and 6.66-ft deeper. (*Approximately 27.8' x 17.2'*)
- A portion of the existing roof and foundation will be maintained. New wood siding and wood windows will match the existing addition.
- The enlarged addition will eliminate one (1) window opening on the rear elevation which will provide access to the addition from the house.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners indicated that a complete elevation showing the proposed rear addition changes in relationship to the entire rear elevation of the building.
- Ordinarily, additions are recessed at least 12-inches from the corner of the main structure to differentiate the addition from the main house.
- The Commission discussed the challenges of enlarging only one side of the rear addition and asked if a concerted effort of both owners might be possible. A design for both sides could making one larger addition would be better, even if one side was only a porch.

6. 14-2-11

40-42 West Third Avenue

Berardi + Partners (Applicant)

SND Partners, LLC (Owner)

An application, siteplan, drawings, and photos have been submitted.

Conceptual Review

- Demolition of existing single-story commercial addition located at 40 West Third Avenue and creation of green space with portions of the existing parking to remain.
- Exterior rehabilitation of the existing Italianate residence single-family residence at 42 West Third Avenue.
- Construct new 3+ story, 16-unit apartment structure on the existing parking area north of the existing building.
- The first floor of the apartment building will contain “at-grade” parking for the residents, floors 2 and 3 will each contain 8 dwelling units, and a partial 4th floor will contain additional space for the 3rd floor corner units.
- The proposed 4th floor will be recessed from the façade to minimize apparent height and massing from grade.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Harding – Thinks the scheme is good. The massing brings the property into the context of Third Avenue. Doesn't believe the “parked-in” concept is a good idea. Indicated that the “penthouse level” could be broken up with alternating between solid material and glass.
- Commissioner Decker – The massing seems to be okay for the location, but the orientation may be an issue. The design seems to face the alley which seems odd. Perhaps an “L-shaped” building footprint that covers part of the surface parking could be considered, which would use the existing lot more fully. It currently “feels” like a sibling to the Jackson, but the building envelope could better relate to the surrounding contributing properties.
- Commissioner Conte – The stacked parking is an issue. The new building should face the main road, Third Avenue, and not alleys. The existing design does not appear to have a front or rear of building; the north and south elevations are the same. The Third Avenue side should be the primary elevation.
- Commissioner Borchers – Agrees with other commissioner comments. The current building design has a large massing, and the large parcel could warrant construction of a multi-tenant building. The building should be “pulled up” to Third Avenue.
- Commissioner Hissem – The building needs to split north/south or east/west and needs to have a proper front and proper back. The mass of the building is large and the design will require some finesse. The site is not on High Street, it is not only a commercial zone, and it is a mixed-use location with residential and commercial uses. The design needs to reflect that mix.

7. 14-2-12

770-786 North Park Street

Schooley Caldwell Associates (Applicant)

Wood Companies (Owner)

An application, siteplan, and drawings have been submitted.

Conceptual Review

- Construct new development on approximately 1 acre site.
- New development to include 100-110 apartments, 10,000-sqft of office space, and approximately 155 parking spaces.
- The design features ‘brownstone’ style townhomes fronting Hubbard Avenue and Park Street, a courtyard, and an apartment building relating to the High Street corridor.
- One level of parking will be entirely below grade and cover nearly the entire site. The second level of parking will be approximate 5’ above grade and behind the ‘brownstones’.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Following the presentation by the applicant, Chair Conte called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slips received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Rob Vogt 775 Park St.	The project has a handsome design with buildings that pick up elements of the surrounding properties. Has a serious concern with such large buildings and overall heights of 4 stories and above. The scale of the development could cause density and traffic issues. The outbuildings should be reduced to 3 stories and the tower should be reduced by 1 story.
Paul Walter 93 W. Hubbard Ave.	Is concerned with the height from the street and the amount of traffic the development will cause. The number of stories on the proposed design is too much; the site is not on High Street. It is out of scale and too much for the area.

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Hissem – Really thinks the project is good and that it will do a lot for the other side of the street versus a surface parking lot. The tower building is still too tall. 4 stories on the row house buildings is okay, but maybe should have a story removed. The new streetscape will be improved the corner of Park Street and Hubbard Avenue.
- Commissioner Borchers – Thinks that the overall the project is great, but the tower is approximately 1 ½ stories too tall. Requested the information on the existing parking agreements for the surface lot that would be displaced.
- Commissioner Conte – The tower is 2 stories too tall. Perhaps 1 story could be removed from one part of the tower, and 2 stories could be removed from another part of the tower.
- Commissioner Decker – The project is not on High Street, and its height is currently too much. As currently designed it would block the sun from the other side of the street. The heights of the buildings need to be lowered. The currently massing increases the apparent mass. It seems as though the project has a ways to go.
- Commissioner Harding – Appreciates that the applicant has modeled the streetscape on Park Street. The height of Victorian Gate does not automatically mean that 4 stories and higher is appropriate at this location. The pocket park entrance concept is good. The current proposed tower height is too tall and needs to be reduced.

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

8. 14-2-13

228 West Second Avenue

MM Developing, LLC (Owner)

Recommend approval of variance application #14-2-13, 228 West Second Avenue, as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

Variance Recommendation Request

- CC3333.23: Minimum Side Yard Permitted – to permit a 3-ft side yard within an ARLD district.
- The current zoning of the property is ARLD (Apartment Residential – Low Density) and not a Residential (such as R2F). The minimum side yard setback required for ARLD is 5-ft, while the minimum side yard setback for R2F, R2, and R4 is 3-ft. As a single family dwelling within the ARLD district the applicant requests a reduction from 5-ft side yard to 3-ft side yard.

MOTION: Decker/Harding (5-0-0) RECOMMEND APPROVAL.

9. 14-2-14

232 West Second Avenue

MM Developing, LLC (Owner)

Recommend approval of variance application #14-2-14, 232 West Second Avenue, as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

Variance Recommendation Request

- CC3333.23: Minimum Side Yard Permitted – to permit a 3-ft side yard within an ARLD district.
- The current zoning of the property is ARLD (Apartment Residential – Low Density) and not a Residential (such as R2F). The minimum side yard setback required for ARLD is 5-ft, while the minimum side yard setback for R2F, R2, and R4 is 3-ft. As a single family dwelling within the ARLD district the applicant requests a reduction from 5-ft side yard to 3-ft side yard.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (5-0-0) RECOMMEND APPROVAL.

10. 14-2-15

771A North High Street

Cold Native Pressed (Applicant)

CMH Midtown Properties, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application #14-2-15, 771A North High Street, as submitted.

Staff Recommended Application

- Install new hanging sign per submitted drawing.
- Install new interior window graphics per submitted drawing.
- Paint existing storefront to match existing.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (5-0-0) APPROVED.

11. 14-2-6a

1128 Highland Street

Renovations Unlimited (Applicant)

Steve & Jackie Winner (Owners)

Application #14-2-6 has been divided into item 'a' for Victorian Village Commission review under Staff Recommended Applications, and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items (see below).

Approve Application #14-2-6a, 1128 Highland Street, as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

- Remove existing deteriorate front porch elements (floor, posts, railing).
- Construct new front porch per submitted drawings and photos.
- Repaint to match existing color scheme.

MOTION: Harding/Hissem (5-0-0) APPROVED.

12. 14-2-16

909 North High Street

Salon Lofts (Applicant)

Wood Companies (Owner)

Approve Application #14-2-16, 909 North High Street, as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

- Install new white signage-band and aluminum plate letters illuminated by existing gooseneck light fixtures per submitted drawing.
- Install new pole sign face with halo-lit letters per submitted drawing.
- Patch and repair existing stucco on façade to receive new finishes as noted. All new finishes to be “Black” to match existing storefront façade.
- Existing metal panels of storefront to be removed and refinished to “like new” condition.
- Existing brick veneer to be cleaned and refinished to “like new” condition.
- Remove existing and install new interior window graphics.

MOTION: Decker/Borchers (5-0-0) APPROVED.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

• **14-2-1**

1176 Harrison Avenue

William Minozzi & Jennifer Smither (Owners)

Approve Application #14-2-1, 1176 Harrison Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove eight (8) non-contributing vinyl windows.
- Install eight (8) new all-wood interior/exterior double-hung windows sized exactly to fit the existing openings.
- Repair any/all rotten/deteriorated wood elements as needed to match existing.
- Paint all new work to match existing.

Replace Non-Original Windows

- Replace all non-original, non-contributing windows with new, 1-OVER-1, wood windows of appropriate dimension and profile and to fit the original openings exactly per submitted window specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

• **14-2-2**

65-67 West Fourth Avenue

Cyril Chambers (Applicant)

James/Cyril Partnership (Owner)

Approve Application #14-2-2, 65-67 West Fourth Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove existing deteriorated asphalt shingle roof.
- Install new asphalt shingle roof in color and type from Approved Shingle List.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate <input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."

- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **14-2-3**

919 Hunter Avenue

Jennifer Porreca & Nicholas Faux (Owners)

Approve Application #14-2-3, 919 Hunter Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove deteriorated/altered wood windows.
- Install new Jeldwen all-wood interior/exterior one-over-one double-hung windows sized exactly to fit existing openings per submitted specifications.

Replace Deteriorated/Altered Windows

- Replace all deteriorated windows per City Staff determination.
- Install new, 1-OVER-1, all-wood, interior/exterior, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

- **14-2-4**

237 West Second Avenue

Ben Glass (Applicant)

Grace Central Presbyterian Church (Owner)

Approve Application #14-2-4, 237 West Second Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove deteriorated/altered basement windows and boarded window enclosure on west elevation.
- Install new Jeldwen all-wood interior/exterior one-over-one double-hung windows sized exactly to fit existing openings per submitted specifications.

Replace Deteriorated/Altered Windows

- Replace all deteriorated windows per City Staff determination.
- Install new, 1-OVER-1, all-wood, interior/exterior, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

- **14-2-5**

895 Dennison Avenue

David Jackson (Owner)

Approve Application #14-2-5, 895 Dennison Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Renew COA#13-2-1, 895 Dennison Avenue, exactly as previously approved for a period of one (1) year.
Expired: 1-9-14.

Approve Application #13-2-1, 895 Dennison Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- *Tuckpoint chimneys as needed and re-align flue liner(s).*
- *Restore corbelling (crown) to all chimneys to match remaining original NW chimney. All brick to be original brick salvaged from house (895 Dennison Ave.).*

Repair Masonry Chimney

- *Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.*

- *New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings", available at <http://www.nps.gov/history/hps/tps/briefs/brief02.htm>).*

- **14-2-6b**

1128 Highland Street

Renovations Unlimited (Applicant)

Steve & Jackie Winner (Owners)

Application #14-2-6 has been divided into item 'a' for Victorian Village Commission review under Staff Recommended Applications (see above), and item 'b' for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items.

Approve Application #14-2-6b, 1128 Highland Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Repair section of overhang on main house to match existing.
- Remove existing asphalt shingle roof and install new asphalt shingle roof from Approved Shingle List.
- Reline existing box gutters.
- Replace existing wood front walk with new concrete walk and brick border.
- Repair/replace downspout drain tile.
- Install one (1) new downspout on south elevation.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate <input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

The Victorian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (4-0-0) APPROVED.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURNMENT – Decker/Borchers (5-0-0) ADJOURNED. 8:25 pm.