

**VICTORIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

**Thursday September 11, 2014
6:15 p.m.**

50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: Alfred Berthold, Aaron Borchers, Marc Conte, Jack Decker, Jeffery Hissem, Lisl Kotheimer.

HPO Staff Present: James Goodman.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:56pm.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Thursday, October 2, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room A.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING –Thursday, October 9, 2014.
- IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Thursday, August 14, 2014. MOTION: Decker/Berthold (6-0-0) APPROVED.
- V. PUBLIC FORUM
- VI. SWEAR IN STAFF
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

1. 14-8-15b

719 & 721 North High Street

Imperial Renovations & Design (Applicant) Wood Companies (Owner)

Approve application #14-8-15b, 719 & 721 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- The internal LED illumination in existing transom windows proposal is removed from the application.
- The second hanging sign is removed from the application.
- Install awnings with 4” loose valences per submitted drawing
- Install new traditional awning located at main entry with 4” loose valence.
- Install new nano wall windows on front elevation designed to match the existing openings and per submitted drawing.
- Revised drawings and specifications to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Decker/Berthold (6-0-0) APPROVED.

NEW APPLICATIONS

2. 14-9-14

783 North High Street

Homage Retail, LLC (Applicant) High & Hubbard, LLC (Owner)

After presentation by the Applicant and discussion by the Victorian Village Commission, Application # 14-9-14 was divided into items ‘a’ and ‘b’ for clarity of review and the following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded:

Approve Application #14-9-14a, 783 North High Street, as submitted:

- Install new 11’ x 24” canvas banner/sign on new brackets.

MOTION: Decker/Berthold (0-6-0) DENIED.

Reason For Denial

- The propose signage banner does not meet the standards established by the Short North Design Guidelines (section 3.39).

Following additional discussion and at the applicant's request, a motion was made for an alternate proposal to install a traditional hanging sign.

Approve Application #14-9-14b, 783 North High Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install the existing HOMAGE hanging sign from the current Italian Village location.
- The bracket for installation is to match the existing bracket of the neighboring storefront (Tigertree).
- Revised information to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval prior to issuance of certificate.

MOTION: Decker/Berthold (6-0-0) APPROVED.

3. 14-9-15

317 West Third Avenue

R. Scott Musuraca (Applicant) Anthony Shuttleworth & Janice Aski (Owners)

Approve Application #14-9-15, 317 West Third Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Enclose portion of rear covered porch to create new $\frac{3}{4}$ bath on ground floor.
- As proposed the new bathroom will be approximately 36-sqft and approximately 28-sqft will remain open porch.
- Exterior siding of porch will be board-and-batten siding painted dark gray.
- A simple metal handrail is to be added at the rear porch steps.

MOTION: Decker/Berthold (6-0-0) APPROVED.

4. 14-9-16

1216 Highland Street

Blostein/Overly Architects (Applicant) Orlie Benjamin & Hope Vitelias (Owners)

Approve Application #14-9-16, 1216 Highland Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Demolish existing two-story covered porch.
- Replace existing 2'-8" door with new 10' x 8' bypass door.
- Replace existing 2'-8" door on second floor with new window.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (6-0-0) APPROVED.

5. 14-9-17

208-212 Wilber Avenue

David M. O'Reilly (Owner)

After presentation by the Applicant and discussion by the Victorian Village Commission, Application # 14-9-17 was divided into items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of review and the following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded:

Approve Application #14-9-17a, 208-212 Wilber Avenue, as submitted:

- Demolish existing 4-car garage.

MOTION: Decker/Berthold (6-0-0) APPROVED.

Approve Application #14-9-17b, 208-212 Wilber Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Construct new 3-car garage with second floor office space.
- Remove existing tree at west corner of lot and plant new 10' dogwood tree.
- The siding is to continue into the gable ends of the carriage house on both sides.
- A third, centered, window is to be included on the alley elevation.

MOTION: Decker/Berthold (5-0-1) APPROVED. [Borchers Recused]

6. 14-9-18

72 West Second Avenue

Segna Associates, Inc. (Applicant)

Mark Alderman (Owner)

After presentation by the Applicant and discussion by the Victorian Village Commission, Application # 14-9-18 was divided into items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of review and the following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded:

Recommend Approval of Application #14-9-18a, 72 West Second Avenue, as submitted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- CC3333.02: to allow a second dwelling unit (i.e., the carriage house) on a parcel with an ARLO zoning classification.
- CC3333.09: to reduce the minimum lot width required for construction of a residence from 50 feet to the existing condition of 44 feet. This variance applies to both the existing residence on the property and the proposed coach house.
- CC3333.11: to reduce the required lot area per dwelling unit from 2,500 square feet to 1,200 square feet.
- CC3333.16: to eliminate the requirement, with respect to the proposed coach house, that each dwelling on the property shall front on a public street.
- CC3333.22: to reduce the required maximum side yard required for the existing borne and proposed coach house from 8.8 feet to 5 feet on the east side of the property, and to reduce the required maximum side yard required for the proposed coach house from 8.8 feet to 3 feet on the west side of the property.
- CC3333.23: reduce the required minimum side yard required for the existing home and proposed coach house from 5 feet to 3 feet on the west side of the property.
- CC3333.24: to reduce the required rear yard setback for the coach house to one (1) foot.
- CC3312.49: to reduce the required number of off-street parking spaces from 4 to 3.
- CC3333.15(c): to increase the maximum lot coverage permitted on the property from 50% to 55%.

MOTION: Decker/Berthold (3-3-0) NOT RECOMMENDED.

Commissioner Comments

- No appropriate design has been submitted and approved prior to request for variance recommendations.

Continue Application #14-9-18b, 72 West Second Avenue, to allow the applicant time to submit revised information:

New Construction

- Demolish existing 20' x 20' concrete block garage.
- Construct new 28'-4" x 34' coach house residence per submitted drawings.

MOTION: Decker/Berthold (6-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- The design of the carriage house should be adjusted to have three (3) separate garage doors. The existing alley is 28-ft wide and provides enough space for maneuvering vehicles.
- A revised design should be developed and presented prior to any variance recommendation request as the variances may need to be adjusted to align with design changes.

7. 14-9-19

913 Neil Avenue

WSA Studio (Applicant)

Will Allen (Owner)

Approve Application #14-9-19, 913 Neil Avenue, as submitted:

- Construct two-story 550-sqft rear addition with rooftop deck.
- Construct 200-sqft rear deck.
- All existing landscaping to remain.

MOTION: Decker/Borchers (2-3-1) DENIED. [Berthold, Decker, Hissem] [Conte Recused]

Reasons For Denial

- CC3116:11: Standards For Alteration – (10) Whenever possible, a new addition or alteration shall be accomplished so that its future removal will not impair the essential form and integrity of the structure.
- CC3116:11: Standards For Alteration – (12) In passing upon appropriateness, the commission shall consider, in addition to any other pertinent factor, the architectural characteristics typical of structures in the district or listed property, the historical and architectural value and significance, architectural style, general design, arrangement, texture, material and color of the architectural feature involved and its relation to the architectural features of other contributing properties in the immediate neighborhood.

Commissioner Comments

- A majority of commissioner reiterated serious concerns with the second floor rooftop deck.
- Commissioner Hissem discussed previous comments and reiterated serious concerns with the rooftop deck. Despite the quality of the modern design, the rooftop deck would set a bad precedent for the neighborhood. Commissioners Decker and Berthold were in agreement.
- Commissioner Kotheimer and Borchers stated support of the overall design based on the overall quality of the architecture.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW APPLICATIONS

8. 14-9-20

903 Neil Avenue

Shawn & Kasey Conyers (Owners)

Conceptual Review

- Demolish existing garage.
- Construct new two-story carriage house.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners indicated support for the proposed design and the demolition of the non-contributing existing garage.
- Drawings including a measured siteplan should be developed for review at a future commission meeting.

9. 14-9-21

116 West Starr Avenue

Sullivan Bruck Architects & Snyder Barker LLC (Applicants)

Aston Place TH 2, LLC (Owner)

Recommend Approval of Application #14-9-21, 16 West Starr Avenue, as submitted:

Variance Recommendation Request

- CC 3333.41(a): less than 1 acre-0.445± acres
- CC 3333.41(b): exceeds maximum 12 units to the acre
- CC 3333.41(c): to permit less than three townhomes in a row
- CC 3333.41(d): development occupies more than 55% of the lot and does not provide at least 20% of private open space
- CC 3333.41(i): does not provide the maximum 7 ½ " side yard on the eastern and western side of the Project
- CC 3333.41(j): closer than 25' to the right of way
- CC 3333.41 (t): less than 400 sq. ft. of open space per dwelling unit in open space.

MOTION: Decker/Berthold (5-1-0) RECOMMEND APPROVAL. [Decker]

Conceptual Review

- Construction of ten (10) new townhomes in four (4) separate buildings; two (2) doubles and two (2) triples.
- Townhouses to be two-bedroom, 2 ½ bath with lower level den and attached two-car garage opening to private drive behind the buildings.
- Private drive is shared with Aston Row Townhouses to the north.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners continue to support the traditional design for the infill project.
- Additional windows or shuttered openings should be added to the west elevation of building located at the corner of Dennison and Starr avenues.

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

10. 14-9-22

Multiple Locations

Short North Alliance (Applicant) City of Columbus (Owner)

Approve Application #14-9-22, Multiple Locations, as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

- Install banners on the seventeen (17) Short North Arches. Four (4) will be installed on each arch (68 total banners.)
- Banner to be 18" x 48" double-faced vinyl and hung on custom aluminum poles.
- Banners to be installed during the holiday season.

MOTION: Decker/Borchers (6-0-0) APPROVED.

11. 14-9-23

50 West Second Avenue

Redesigns Architecture & Planning (Applicant) Shaw Davis Company (Owner)

Approve Application #14-9-23, 50 West Second Avenue, as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

- Expand the second floor of the existing residence by approximately 72-sqft per submitted drawings.
- All exterior materials and finishes to match existing.
- Re-install existing second floor window on the exterior wall of the new second floor addition.

MOTION: Decker/Berthold (6-0-0) APPROVED.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

(The following applicants do not need to attend.)

• **14-9-1**

251 West Third Avenue

Ericka Bruns (Owner)

Approve Application #14-9-1, 251 West Third Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new metal railing on existing rear porch/stoop.
- Railing to be 36" in height and manufactured by Gilpin per submitted specifications.

• **14-9-2**

994 Harrison Avenue

Total Restoration Services (Applicant) Kevin McGovern (Owner)

Approve Application #14-9-2, 994 Harrison Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove deteriorated roofing from rear addition.
- Install new rubber membrane roofing on rear addition per submitted specifications.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the rear addition down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.

- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

- **14-9-3**
965 Hunter Avenue
Todd & Julie Horning (Owners)
Approve Application #14-9-3, 965 Hunter Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Remove existing deteriorated rear yard privacy fence.
 - Install new 6' wood privacy fence in rear yard and associated gates per submitted specifications.Install New Privacy Fence
 - Install new 6' wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **14-9-4**
48 Victorian Gate Way (Victorian Gate Condominium)
Carol Meyer/Pella Windows (Applicant) Tim Sonner (Owner)
Approve Application #14-9-4, 48 Victorian Gate Way, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Remove existing aluminum windows from six (6) window openings (6 units total).
 - Install new Pella "Impervia" composite windows in existing openings to match existing profiles and color per submitted specifications.

- **14-9-5**
76 West Second Avenue
Frank A. Lazar (Owner)
Approve Application #14-9-5, 76 West Second Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Remove existing non-historic blue canvas canopy at front entry.
 - Move flowers and plants in front yard.
 - Plant addition new perennials and mulch as needed.
 - Trim boxwood hedges as needed.

- **14-9-6**
309 Tappan Street
Global Builders (Applicant) John Mastronarde (Owner)
Approve Application #14-9-6, 309 Tappan Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Remove asphalt shingle roof.
 - Install new GAF "Royal Sovereign" 3Tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be "Nickel Gray".
 - Install metal ridge roll, valleys, and flashing; to be painted "Gray".Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof
 - Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
 - Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
 - Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
 - Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
 - Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
 - Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Shingle to be GAF "Royal Sovereign" 3Tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be "Estate Gray".

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **14-9-7**

337-343 Tappan Street & 1050-1052 Harrison Avenue

Richard Bruggeman (Owner)

Approve Application #14-9-7, 337-343 Tappan Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint any/all trim as needed to match existing.
- Repair rear deck as need to match existing.
- Repair/replace basement window coverings and paint to match existing.

Exterior Painting

- Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible**

- **14-9-8**

773 Dennison Avenue

Jeff Smith (Owner)

Approve Application #14-9-8, 773 Dennison Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint trim and siding on south elevation of carriage house to match existing.

Exterior Painting

- Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

- **14-9-9**

- **309 Tappan Street**

- **John Mastronarde (Owner)**

- Approve Application #14-9-9, 309 Tappan Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint residence: body to be Behr “Equestrian Green” (S410-7), trim to be Behr “Sporting Green” (HDC-CL-21).

- Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **14-9-10**

- **53 Price Avenue**

- **53 Price, LLC (Owner)**

- Approve Application #14-9-10, 53 Price Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Paint residence per submitted specifications: colors to be Valspar “Hydrangea Blue” (VR055D), Valspar “Ruby Nights” (VR032A), and Valspar “Cottage By The Sea” (VR055B).

- Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **14-9-11**

- **317 Tappan Street**

- **Ascent Roofing Solutions, LLC (Applicant) Tanner Kamalsky (Owner)**

- Approve Application #14-9-11, 317 Tappan Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove deteriorated roofing from front porch.
- Install new rubber membrane roofing on front porch per submitted specifications.
- Install new GAF “Royal Sovereign” 3Tab asphalt shingle on mansard section of porch roof; color to be “Nickel Gray”.

- Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the front porch down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
 - Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
 - Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
 - Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
 - Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
 - Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.
- **14-9-12**
36 West Russell Street (Victorian Gate Condominium)
Carol Meyer/Pella Windows (Applicant) Connie Bachman (Owner)
Approve Application #14-9-12, 36 West Russell Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Remove existing aluminum windows from four (4) window openings (*6 units total*).
 - Install new Pella "Impervia" composite windows in existing openings to match existing profiles and color per submitted specifications.
 - **14-9-13**
1124-1124½ Highland Street
Tracy Allen (Owner)
Approve Application #14-9-13, 1124-1124½ Highland Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Remove existing sections of wood privacy fence along the south, east, and west property lines.
 - Install new 6' wood privacy fence in the same locations per submitted details.Install New Privacy Fence
 - Install new 6' wood privacy fence along per submitted design and siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

The Victorian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Decker/Borchers (6-0-0) APPROVED.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURNMENT – Decker/Hissem (6-0-0) ADJOURNED. 8:25 pm.