

**VICTORIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

Thursday June 11, 2015

5:00 p.m.

50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: Aaron Borchers, Marc Conte, Shawn Conyers, Jack Decker, Jeffery Hissem, Lisl Kotheimer (5:06pm).

HPO Staff Present: James Goodman.

- I.** CALL TO ORDER – 6:05pm.
- II.** NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Thursday, July 2, 2015 – 50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor - Conference Room A.
- III.** NEXT COMMISSION HEARING –Thursday, July 9, 2015.
- IV.** SWEAR IN STAFF
- V.** APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Thursday, May 14, 2015. MOTION: Decker/Conyers (5-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI.** PUBLIC FORUM
- VII.** STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII.** STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS
- IX.** APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW APPLICATIONS

1. 15-6-11

955-987 N. High St.

Connie J. Klema, Attorney (Applicant)

White Castle System, Inc (Owner)

Conceptual Review

- Redevelopment of the existing White Castle site, to incorporate: a new White Castle restaurant, a public/private parking structure, commercial & retail uses, and residential apartments on the existing surface parking lots owned by White Castle and the City of Columbus.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Following the presentation by the applicant, Chair Conte called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slips received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Jan Weisenberger 61 W. Second Ave.	The size and mass of the project is too large and does not fit the neighborhood.
Rich Jacob 61 W. Second Ave.	Supports the Commission. The proposed project is massive and is not stylistically consistent with the neighborhood. Traffic increases will be too much for the area.
Scott Felker 46 W. Starr Ave.	Is a longtime resident of the neighborhood and believes that the project is too large and too tall.

Victorian Village Commission
Thursday, June 11, 2015 - Minutes

Gareth Gwyn 73 W. Second Ave.	The design is too large and is oversized for the lot. The ascetics do not fit the neighborhood. Parking should be below ground to lower the height of the garage.
Lisa Wood 41 W. Second Ave.	The amount of traffic the project will bring is too much for the area and the ingress and egress of the parking garage is wrong.
Joyce Martin 54 W. Second Ave.	The building is not the right size for the neighborhood; it's too large and doesn't fit. The plans do not seem to respond to the previous Commission and neighborhood comments.
Bill Wood 41 W. Second Ave.	The size of the building and the amount of uses do not fit the neighborhood.
Adam Shaw 50 W. Second Ave.	The height and size of the building are too much for the neighborhood. Redeveloping the lot is good, but not this much.
Kathy Rhinehart 51 W. Second Ave.	Supports development; however, this proposal would negatively change the quality of life in the area. The increase in sound and traffic would also be too much.
Ross Rhinehart 51 W. Second Ave.	The project needs to have a balance. There should be fewer units and fewer parking spaces. The project needs to fit the site.
Joanne Goldhand 90 W. Second Ave.	Big buildings create a wall around the neighborhood which isn't good. Unlike other streets in the area, Second Avenue interacts with High Street. The alley is a part of the neighborhood too. The project is too much for the area.
Joe Valent 989 N. High St.	The size of the project needs to be reduced. An emphasis on 24-hour activity at the location is not a positive direction for the neighborhood.
Frank Lazar 76 W. Second Ave.	The biggest concern is the height of the project and the amount of shade that it will cast on the neighborhood. 11 stories is too much and the current design is ugly.

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Conyers – The Commission has discussed the size of the project at previous meetings. Going forward the mass and the height of the project need to be addressed.
- Commissioner Borchers – The mass of the building is too much. The current design is too tall and too box-like. The effect of traffic on the area needs to be studied. Significant work is needed on the massing. Large setbacks are needed. Is not sure that all these functions (residential, retail, office, and parking) can occur on the same lot. Understands that there is an economic balance that needs to be met.
- Commissioner Decker – The design revisions have selectively responded to Commission feedback and very little has been changed in the design. City Code and the Short North Guidelines guide the Commission on evaluated projects. The project currently does not meeting CC3316:12 Standards For new Construction. It should not overwhelm contributing buildings, and cannot be approved as currently designed. A smaller more articulated building design is needed. The height and massing of the proposal need to be addressed first.
- Commissioner Conte – Agrees with the other Commissioner Comments. The feedback needs to be addresses. Perhaps the goals of the project need to be reevaluated.
- Commissioner Kotheimer – Not seeing a response to previous comments and not understanding the goals of the project. The design might try to slide pieces in and out and work with compression to reduce the visual size. Traffic circulation at the site is a concern. The current proposal seems Las Vegas size. Encourages the continued design attempts to reduce and breakdown the size.
- Commissioner Hissem – There have been many comments from the neighborhood and Commission. The other projects in the past have received criticism from the neighborhood and became better projects because of that feedback. Response to comments is needed. The 24-hour destination concept for the location is not a good idea. The commercial aspect of the project is important. The developers are listening, but a design “breakthrough” is needed.

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

2. 15-6-12

207 Wilber Ave.

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant) Aaron Borchers (Owner)

Approve application #15-6-12, 207 Wilber Ave., as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

- Rebuild existing altered chimneys per submitted drawing. The new design will be similar to those of adjacent properties with intact historic chimney designs.
- All new brick to match existing.

MOTION: Decker/Kotheimer (5-0-0) APPROVED. [Borchers Abstained]

3. 15-6-13

965 N. High St.

Branham Sign Co. (Applicant) White Castle System, Inc. (Owner)

Approve application #15-6-13, 965 N. High St., as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

- Install one (1) single-face 9-sqft internally illuminated pre-menu board adjacent to the drive-thru lane.

MOTION: Decker/Borchers (6-0-0) APPROVED.

4. 15-6-14

164 Buttles Ave.

Feazel Roofing (Applicant) James Miller (Owner)

Approve application #15-6-14, 164 Buttles Ave., as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

- Remove deteriorated slate roof from garage.
- Install new Owens Corning 3tab asphalt shingle roof; color to be “Estate Gray”.
- Install metal ridge roll; color to be “Tinner’s Red”.

MOTION: Decker/Conte (6-0-0) APPROVED.

5. 15-6-15

641 N. High St.

Wood Companies (Owner)

Approve application #15-6-15, 641 N. High St., as submitted:

Staff Recommended Application

- This project proposes to replace the entry doors, sidelight glazing, and wood soffit of the recessed storefront entry installed in 1986.
- All of the original glazing, fenestration and cast iron components of the historic façade will remain and are only scheduled to be repainted with a gloss black finish.
- Existing 1986 vintage concrete pavement at the recessed entry will be covered with a porcelain mosaic tile to be set flush with the sidewalk.
- New entry door, sidelight and transom glass will be black prefinished aluminum storefront system. The door will have stainless steel push/pulls
- The wood soffit/ceiling installed in 1986 will be raised to align with the intermediate mullion between the upper and lower transoms (approximately 11'-6") Soffit to be painted black.
- A new linear light fixture (make/model TBD) will be installed at the soffit/ceiling.
- The existing wall base (approximately 16" high) will be finished with a black slate cut stone.

MOTION: Decker/Kotheimer (6-0-0) APPROVED.

HOLDOVERS

6. 15-5-16b

868 Park St.

Connect Realty, LLC (Applicant) Exclusive Deuce, LLC (Owner)

Approve application #15-5-16b, 868 Park St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Installation of new dumpster location.
- Concrete pad and dumpster to be surrounded by wood privacy fence, shrubs and mulch bed.
- The dumpster enclosure fence is to be board-on-board with flat top and a gate. Enclosure to be painted "red" to match the color of the rear decks.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (6-0-0) APPROVED.

NEW APPLICATIONS

7. 15-6-16

187-189 W. First Ave.

Randy Belden (Owner)

Approve application #15-6-16, 187-189 W. First Ave., as submitted:

- Installation issues with previously approved window replacement project (COA#14-10-5).
- New windows have been installed "jamb inside jamb", thereby downsizing the window openings.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (0-6-0) DENIED.

Reasons For Denial

- CC3116:11: Standards For Alteration – (2) The distinguishing characteristics of the property shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural feature shall be avoided whenever possible.
- CC3116:11: Standards For Alteration – (5) Distinctive stylistic features and examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be treated with sensitivity.
- CC3116:11: Standards For Alteration – (6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features shall be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other structures.

- CC3116:11: Standards For Alteration – (12) In passing upon appropriateness, the commission shall consider, in addition to any other pertinent factor, the architectural characteristics typical of structures in the district or listed property, the historical and architectural value and significance, architectural style, general design, arrangement, texture, material and color of the architectural feature involved and its relation to the architectural features of other contributing properties in the immediate neighborhood.

8. 15-6-17

1140 Harrison Ave.

Sara Knox & Jiamei Zhang (Owners)

Approve application #15-6-17, 1140 Harrison Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Construct new 10' x 10' rear single-story addition.
- The siding is to be hardi-plank with a 4" lap exposure and traditional trim (cornerboards, window casings, etc.).
- The side window is to be larger, taking its size from the existing windows on the house.
- The light fixture is to be changed to a gooseneck fixture located above the door.
- Revised drawings are to be submitted to HPO Staff for final review and approval.

MOTION: Decker/Hissem (6-0-0) APPROVED.

9. 15-6-18

944 Neil Ave.

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)

Steve Cooney (Owner)

Approve application #15-6-18, 944 Neil Ave., as submitted:

- Replace four (4) non-original porch columns with new smooth tapered columns similar to original columns.
- Replace railing with square baluster railing.
- Replace deteriorate porch floor with new 1x4 tongue and groove mahogany porch floor.

MOTION: Decker/Conyers (6-0-0) APPROVED.

10. 15-6-19

853 N. Park St.

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)

Haley Boehning & Charlie Goodlad (Owners)

After presentation by the Applicant and discussion by the Victorian Village Commission, Application #15-6-19 was divided into items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of review and the following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded:

Approve application #15-6-19a, 853 N. Park St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

Exterior Building Alteration

- Add a second floor to existing garage to create a carriage house.
- Cover existing concrete block and new addition with siding to match the house addition.
- Windows to be aluminum-clad wood, doors to be 4-panel smooth fiberglass.
- All colors to match main house.
- The skylight is to be moved to the roof of the east elevation.
- The garage doors and door are to be clad in a manner that obscures the door location and balances the elevation visually.
- A gooseneck fixture is to be installed over the entry door.
- Revised drawings are to be submitted to HPO Staff for review by the Architectural Subcommittee.

MOTION: Decker/Kotheimer (6-0-0) APPROVED.

Recommend approval of application #15-6-19b, 853 N. Park St., as submitted:

Variance Recommendation

- CC3332.039: R-4 residential district - applicant seeks a variance to permit separate residence to be constructed on single parcel, which is not permitted in a R-4 district.
- CC3332.19: Fronting on a public street - Applicant seeks variance to allow the carriage house to front on the public alley.

- CC3332.25: Maximum Side Yard - as a residence, the carriage house would be required to have the sum of each side yard equal or exceed 20% lot width. The lot is 40' wide, which would require 8' of total side yard. Applicant seeks a variance to permit the carriage house to have a total side yard of 7.3'.
- CC3332.26(c): (1) Minimum side-yard - Under zoning code, the carriage house would be required to have a minimum side yard of 3'. Applicant seeks a variance to allow a side-yard on the north side of the garage to total 2.3'.
- CC3333.27: Rear yard - Zoning code requires each dwelling to have a rear yard equal to 25% of the gross lot area. 25% of the lot area equals 1,800 square feet. The yard between the carriage house and the original house is approximately 2,536 square feet. While a large area, this is not enough area to provide each residence with a rear-yard equal to 1,800 sf (25% of the lot area). Applicant seeks a variance to permit the carriage house to have a rear-yard of 736 square feet (18.4' x 40) which would leave the original house with the required 1,800 square feet.
- CC3312.49: Minimum number of required parking spaces - Applicant seeks a variance to allow for a reduction from 4 off-street parking spaces to 2. The current single-family house has two off-street parking spaces located in the garage. The project will not remove any off-street parking, but the Carriage House would normally require 2 additional parking spaces for a total of 4 spaces.

MOTION: Decker/Kotheimer (6-0-0) RECOMMEND APPROVAL.

11. 15-6-20

1123 Neil Ave.

Mike Spencer (Owner)

Approve application #15-6-20, 1123 Neil Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Install new landscaping plan, including: paver patio, retaining wall, seat walls and various plantings.
- The owner has the option of substituting portions of the pavers with red brick pavers.

MOTION: Decker/Borchers (6-0-0) APPROVED.

12. 15-6-21

1195-1201 & 1203-1209 N. High St.

Legat Kingscott Architects (Applicant)

Omnilife/Equity Management (Owner)

Approve application #15-6-21, 1195-1209 N. High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Replacement of all ground floor storefront and entry systems with new aluminum storefronts; color to be "Dark Bronze" to correlate to the existing brick and adjacent storefronts.
- All vertical and horizontal mullion patterns will be matched.
- For all addresses, the existing plywood will be removed. 1195 & 1201 N. High will have glass transoms, and 1203-1209 will have new exterior wood finish and trim (due to concrete block wall in transom locations).
- The two (2) existing internally illuminated signs located on the 1203-1209 N. High building are to be removed.

MOTION: Decker/Borchers (6-0-0) APPROVED.

STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS

• **15-6-1**

58 W. Lincoln St.

Carol Meyer (Applicant)

Kathleen Luebbert (Owner)

Approve Application #15-6-1, 58 W. Lincoln St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Renew COA#12-12-12, 58 W. Lincoln St., exactly as previously approved for a period of one (1) year. Expired: 12-5-13.

• **15-6-2**

990 Neil Ave.

John Chmielewski (Applicant)

Greg Ghirardi (Owner)

Approve Application #15-6-2, 990 Neil Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Remove two (2) non-historic casement windows on front elevation.
- Install two (2) new all-wood interior/exterior Pella casement windows sized exactly to fit the existing openings.

- **15-6-3**
201 W. Second Ave. & 985-987 Hunter Ave.
Hunter Village Condo Association (Owner)
Approve Application #15-6-3, 201 W. Second Ave. & 985-987 Hunter Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Remove existing deteriorated/non-historic 3' metal fence.
 - Install new 3' aluminum fence same location and per submitted siteplan and specifications.

- **15-6-4**
22 W. Fourth Ave.
Pro Exterior By APCO (Applicant) Linda Chun (Owner)
Approve Application #15-6-4, 22 W. Fourth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Remove six (6) deteriorated wood double-hung windows.
 - Install six (6) new all-wood interior/exterior double-hung windows sized exactly to fit the existing openings; new units to be Marvin Ultimate Wood Insert replacement windows.

- **15-6-5**
295 W. Fourth Ave.
New Victorians (Applicant) Joe Armeni & Amy Solerno (Owners)
Approve Application #15-6-5, 295 W. Fourth Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Replace deteriorated front concrete steps to match existing like-for-like.

- **15-6-6**
339 W. Second Ave.
Marc Archuleta (Owner)
Approve Application #15-6-6, 339 W. Second Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Paint siding, trim, and soffits to match existing.
 - Paint roof rafters and gable end "Tinner's Red".

Exterior Painting

 - Paint to match existing color scheme. Any new colors are to be submitted with paint color chips to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
 - Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
 - Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
 - Glaze and caulk as necessary.
 - Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
 - **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
 - **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

- **15-6-7**
339 W. Second Ave.
ACI Construction & Restoration (Applicant) Marc Archuleta (Owner)
Approve Application #15-6-7, 339 W. Second Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:
 - Remove existing asphalt shingle roof and existing k-style gutters.
 - Install new GAF "Slateline" dimensional asphalt shingle roof; color to be "Weathered Slate".
 - Install new metal ridge roll, valleys, and flashing; color to be "Tinner's Red".
 - Install new k-style gutters and downspouts; color to be "Tinner's Red".

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Shingle to be GAF "Slateline" dimensional shingle; color to be "Weathered Slate".
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **15-6-8**

937 N. High St.

Nathan DeMars (Applicant) Wood Companies (Owner)

Approve Application #15-6-8, 937 N. High St., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new 3' diameter non-illuminated hanging sign on existing bracket per submitted drawings and specifications.

• **15-6-9**

884-886 & 888-890 Dennison Ave.

Quinn Lamb (Owner)

Approve Application #15-6-9, 884-886 & 888-890 Dennison Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Install new smooth 4-panel steel doors on the rear elevations per submitted cutsheet (4 total).
- Replace any/all broken glass and plexi-glass as needed in windows and storm windows on front elevations.

Install New Door

- Install new, solid core door in existing door jamb.
- New door to be either a four-panel or half-lite: [] wood, [] fiberglass, or [] metal. Set on 1 1/2" pair 3 1/2" x 3 1/2" butt hinges; hinge locations to be determined by the existing jamb.
- Wood units to be stained or painted; finish all six sides. Exterior and hinged sides of fiberglass and metal doors to be painted. Interior and keyed sides of fiberglass and metal doors to be either painted or stained.
- Paint/stain color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint/stain.

• **15-6-10**

968 Harrison Ave.

Greg Bolyard (Owner)

Approve Application #15-6-10, 968 Harrison Ave., as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Renew COA#12-12-12, 58 W. Lincoln St., exactly as previously approved for a period of one (1) year. Expired: 12-5-13.

The Victorian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Decker/Conyers (6-0-0) APPROVED.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURNMENT—Decker/Borchers (6-0-0) ADJOURNED. 6:50 pm.