

University Area Review Board

50 West Gay Street, Fourth Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-9031
(614) 645-6096 (614) 645-1483 fax

MEETING SUMMARY

date	May 21, 2015
place	Northwood & High Building 2231 North High Street, Room 100
time	6:30pm – 11:25pm
members present	Ted Goodman, Brian Horne, Bob Mickley, Pasquale Grado, Richard Talbott
members absent	Doreen Uhas-Sauer, Frank Petruziello

A.

1. **Business of the Board** **Induct and meet new Board Member - Richard Talbott**

- Mr. Ferdelman inducted Mr. Talbott.

2. **Approval of Meeting Summary from April 2015** **Mr. Grado/ Mr. Horne**

motion
6:30 - 6:33 **To approve with correction:**
Mr. Grado requested that a new rule be enacted to require UAC recommendation prior to UARB issuing its own recommendation on zoning requests.

vote
5-0 to Approve

3. **New Standing Rule for the University Area Review Board**

- Mr. Grado requested the Board vote on a motion to include a new rule in the UARB By-Laws. That all Variances and Rezoning's be routed and recommended by the UAC prior to the UARB's recommendation is recorded.
- Mr. Mickley questioned whether the UARB is charged to review projects independently.
- Mr. Ferdelman commented that the Code is not specific, but it does charge the Board to be composed of a representative of the UAC, UCBA and one At-Large Member (a resident of the District).
- Mr. Grado and Mr. Talbott stated that the process had become divisive; Applicants play the UARB against the UAC.
- Mr. Horne commented that the UARB does not need to agree with the UAC's recommendation.
- Mr. Mickley expressed concern regarding the time that will be involved in getting approvals.

motion by
Mr. Grado/ Mr. Talbott

motion
6:33 - 6:45 **To approve a new Standing Rule:**
To require UAC recommendation prior to UARB issuing its own recommendation on zoning requests.

vote
4-1 to Approve (Mr. Mickley)

B.

1. **Applications for Certificate of Approval** **East 8th Avenue, East 9th Avenue, Pearl Alley and Section Alley** **Building 2 - SCG South Residential | Gateway II**

applicant: Stephen M. Caplinger (Creative Design + Planning), Brad Parrish (Architectural Alliance), Erin Prosser (Campus Partners)

to be reviewed: building and site review
6:45 – 7:20

- Mr. Ferdelman reviewed the slides and staff report.
- Mr. Parish reviewed modification from last month's presentation; the structural system of the garage was changed and new punched windows were added; the colors were modified to address Board concerns.

- The Board and Applicants discussed the use of Hardie-Board and masonry
- Mr. Horne questioned the use of punched windows on the garage; might the garage be more open.
- Mr. Parish stated that the punched windows were a result of the structural needs of the garage itself.
- Mr. Goodman suggested a window pattern in the voids.
- Mr. Parish stated that the first floor openings have that screening
- Mr. Horne suggested adding the grid to the second floor openings.
- Mr. Talbott expressed support for the garage design.
- Mr. Caplinger reviewed the landscape design and lighting.
- The Board and Applicants discussed the Pearl Street details. 40
- Mr. Horne suggested that the garage should be of a different color
- Mr. Parish replied that the color could be similar to the Hardie-Board, Timber Bark.
- The Board and Applicants discussed the lighting in the garage and around the site.

motion by | **Mr. Horne / Mr. Mickley**

motion | **To approve the proposal as submitted on the condition:**

- **That the grids used in the openings on the first level of the garage be included on the second level of the garage.**
- **That the color of the garage finish shall match the Timber Bark color used for the siding.**
- **That the garage lighting be submitted to staff for review and approval; the garage lighting shall be cutoff fixtures that are directed inward away from the openings.**

vote | **5-0 to Approve**

2. | **20 East 13th Avenue** | **Formaggio**
applicant: | Gino Bambino (Bambino Studios)
to be reviewed: | sign
7:20 – 7:32

- Mr. Ferdelman reviewed the slides and staff report.
- Mr. Grado commented that the tagline “Great American Bar” should be removed.
- Mr. Goodman questioned the location of the raceway.
- The Board and applicant discussed the location of the sign.

motion by | **Mr. Talbott/ Mr. Mickley**

motion | **To approve the proposal as submitted on the condition:**

- **That the tagline, “True American Bar” be removed.**
- **That center new sign with existing signs to the West.**

vote | **5-0 to Approve**

3. | **1562 North High Street (SCG)** | **90° Lab**
applicant: | Brian Thomas (National Sign Systems)
to be reviewed: | sign
7:32 – 7:47

- Mr. Ferdelman reviewed the slides and staff report.
- The Board and Applicant discussed the size of the sign.
- Mr. Talbott stated the size and location of the sign did not bother him.
- Mr. Grado suggested a projecting sig.
- Mr. Thomas stated a projecting sign was reviewed, but the leadership requested the wall sign.

motion by | **Mr. Horne / Mr. Mickley**

motion | **To approve the proposed sign as submitted.**

vote | **4-1 to Approve (Mr. Grado)**

4.
applicant: **1624 North High Street (SCG)**
to be reviewed: Jim Dreiss (JG Dreiss Architect, LLC)
7:47 – 8:10 storefront, signage

Yoga Six

- Mr. Ferdelman reviewed the slides and staff report.
- Mr. Dreiss reviewed the proposal, including the use of window film on the storefront glass.
- Mr. Grado commented that he did not find that the awnings do not work; the spandrel should be made black.
- The Board and Applicant discussed the signs.
- Mr. Goodman suggested movable partitions to screen the yoga participants.
- Mr. Ferdelman suggested getting approval for all items except for the obscuring film.

motion by **Mr. Talbott / Mr. Horne**

To approve the proposal as submitted on the condition:

- motion
- **That the windows shall have no obscuring film.**
 - **That the dark sign option is appropriate.**
 - **That the projection of the blade sign shall be reduced to 3'-3"**
 - **That the proposal shall have no awnings**

vote **5-0 to Approve**

5.
applicant: **1864 North High Street (SCG)**
to be reviewed: Steve Volkmann (Ohio State PARE), Jeremy Stone, Merijn van der Heijden (Urban Art Space)
8:10 – 8:18 art mural

Art Installation

- Mr. Ferdelman reviewed the slides and staff report.
- Ms. Heijden stated that this piece by Felix Gonzalez Torres is one of many installations being placed around the City of Columbus in the coming months from the OSU Urban Art Space collection.
- Mr. Stone commented that the installation is eight separate panels that will be mounted to the wall.
- Mr. Grado questioned whether the piece would become demolished with the building next year.
- Mr. Stone stated that it has not been determined at the moment. Ms. Heijden stated that they may move it to a more suitable location on Campus.

motion by **Mr. Mickley / Ms. Grado**

motion **To approve the proposal as submitted.**

vote **4-0-1 to Approve (Talbott)**

6.
applicant: **1393 North High Street**
to be reviewed: James Cox (Vic Art Masonry)
8:18 sign

Bio-Blood Components

- Applicant did not show

7. **1725 Summit Street** **Multi-Family Residential**
applicant: Bradley Blumensheid (Rhythm Architecture & Design), Wayne Garland (Owner)
to be reviewed: addition
8:18 – 8:32

- Mr. Ferdelman reviewed the slides and staff report.
- Mr. Grado questioned whether the seven spaces and the dumpsters can fit on the parcel with all other needs.
- Mr. Blumensheid stated that the dumpsters could not fit.
- Mr. Garland stated that the dumpsters are not Buckeye's and they will be relocated.
- Mr. Goodman commented that the post should be interrupted by the deck.
- Mr. Horne commented that the addition needs to be come secondary to the main building; the addition could be rotated.

motion **Tabled**
To be considered:

- **That post should be interrupted by the deck.**
- **Rotate the addition.**
- **Remove dumpsters.**
- **Revise Site Plan.**

8. **44 West 9th Avenue** **Multi-Family Residential**
applicant: Bradley Blumensheid (Rhythm Architecture & Design), Wayne Garland (Owner)
to be reviewed: exterior modifications
8:32 - 8:45

- Mr. Mickley recused himself from the deliberation and vote.
- Mr. Ferdelman reviewed the slides and staff report and asked why the previous plan was not moving forward.
- Mr. Garland stated that the site compliance meeting with the City of Columbus added \$1 million to the projects budget (24" sewer in High Street); we decided to scale down the projects.
- The Board and Applicant discussed the utilities on High Street and Wall Street.
- Mr. Talbott suggested the use of a 6:12 roof pitch.
- Mr. Blumensheid stated that the 6:12 roof looked too tall.
- Mr. Goodman questioned whether the front porch could be made larger.
- Mr. Horne suggested pulling the posts out to the corners and make them significant.

motion by **Mr. Talbott / Mr. Horne**

motion **To approve the proposal as submitted on the condition:**

- **That new porch roof is as wide as the entry projection.**
- **That the porch columns are larger, minimum 1x wood over 6x6 posts.**
- **That side vent dormers be included if necessary.**
- **That drawings sent to staff for review and approval**

vote **4-0 to Approve**

C.

Applications for Zoning, Code Enforcement and/or Conceptual Review

1. 345 West 8th Avenue Multi-Family Residential

applicant: Bradley Blumensheid (Rhythm Architecture & Design), Wayne Garland (Owner)
to be reviewed: variance recommendation | building and site review
8:45 – 9:00

- Mr. Mickley recused himself from the deliberation and vote.
- Mr. Ferdelman reviewed the slides and staff report.
- Mr. Garland stated that the addition is supported by the adjacent neighbors.
- Mr. Horne commented that the addition should have a hip or flat roof.
- Mr. Talbott was supportive of the addition but suggested cladding the front of the building with a similar brick to the main house.
- Mr. Grado stated that the Variances must be passed through the UAC before they come to the UARB.
- Mr. Goodman commented that the building has too many roof pitches.

motion

Tabled

To be considered:

- **That the roof on the addition can be hip or flat.**
- **That the addition should be clad in brick similar to the main.**

2. 1423 North High Street Northside Library

applicant: Wendy Tressler, Nikki Scrapetti (CML), Tracy Perry, Tony Murray, Mike Suriano (NBBJ Architects)
to be reviewed: conceptual review | building and site review
9:00 – 9:35

- Mr. Mickley returned to consider cases.
- Mr. Ferdelman reviewed the slides and staff report.
- Ms. Perry reviewed the process of review and development.
- Ms. Scrapetti discussed the international library conference in 2016.
- Mr. Murray discussed the site plan and landscaping.
- Mr. Mickley questioned the concrete wall along the North half of the East (High Street) façade.
- Mr. Murray stated that a switch grass will be planted along that wall; that will remain standing almost year-round.
- The Board and Applicants discussed the concerns regarding vagrants sleeping under the canopy.
- Mr. Suriano discussed the materials, program, building layout and site.
- Ms. Perry explained the variances for the project.
- Mr. Talbott commented that he finds the surface under the overhang will be problematic to clean.
- Mr. Grado commented that the vertical elements could be lit in an interesting way - top lit, bottom lit or internally lit.
- Mr. Suriano commented that the canopy ceiling will be metal panel.
- Mr. Horne suggested different materials for the Northern wall – possibly a living wall.
- Mr. Mickley stated that the building is a good design, thought the prospect of people sleeping under the canopy should be considered.

motion

Tabled

To be considered:

- **That a different surface be used under the canopy.**
- **That light under the canopy be well thought out.**
- **Different material for Northern portion of East wall – living wall.**

3. | **15 East Avenue** | **Lane & High | Mixed-Use**
applicant: | Mike Fitzpatrick, Jeff Meacham, Paul Kwapich (Elford Development) , Brad Parrish (Architectural Alliance
to be reviewed: | variance recommendation | conceptual review | building and site review
9:35

- Applicant requested that the proposal be tabled just prior to meeting.

4. | **1452 Indianola Avenue** | **Mixed-Use to Multi-Family**
applicant: | Daniel Imlay, Karrick Sherrill (Schremshock Architects) Kevin Lykens (Owner)
to be reviewed: | variance recommendation | conceptual review | building alteration
9:35 – 9:56

- Mr. Ferdelman reviewed the slides and staff report.
- Mr. Sherrill reviewed the modifications in the elevation to address previous comments.
- Mr. Grado praised the new window layout and exterior details.
- Mr. Goodman stated that he liked the changes but the drawings lack enough detail for the Board to vote on a COA.
- Mr. Sherrill reviewed the drawings on A21 and A22 showing the elevations.
- Mr. Goodman commented that the drawings still lack details – the handrails that are proposed, the galvanized panels, the profile through the door surrounds and color palate.
- Mr. Grado stated the proposal could be granted conditional approval.
- Mr. Horne noted discrepancies between the material callout and how they are detailed in the drawing.
- The Board and Applicants discuss the requirements to get COA.
- Mr. Talbott expressed concern regarding giving approvals for part of a building when completing the building requires variances.

motion | **Tabled**
To be considered:

- **Provide dimensioned drawings with plan, elevations, sections and details.**
- **Fix discrepancies between notes and drawing.**

5. | **East 15th Avenue and North High Street** | **15th & High**
applicant: | Amanda Hoffsis, Erin Prosser, Keith Meyers (Campus Partners)
to be reviewed: | conceptual review
9:56 – 10:12

- Mr. Ferdelman reviewed the slides and staff report.
- Ms. Hoffsis reviewed the changes in the plan since input from the UAC and the City of Columbus; the development will include a eight to 10 story hotel, a parking garage, ground floor retail, offices for the University and residential units
- The Board and Applicants discussed the ownership/partnership of the development and how each segment will be built over time by different teams though Campus Partners will control design of each segment.

motion by | **Mr. Grado / Mr. Talbott**
motion | **To support the proposed CPD as submitted.**
vote | **5-0 to Approve**

6. **67 East 15th Avenue** **Delta Tau Delta Fraternity**
 applicant: Nicholas Cavalaris (Kegler Brown Hill + Ritter), Joe Segna (Segna Architects), Buck Burn (DTD Asscoc.)
 to be reviewed: variance recommendation | conceptual review | building addition
 10:12 – 10:40

- Mr. Ferdelman reviewed the slides and staff report.
- Mr. Cavalaris reviewed the program, housing policy from Ohio State and zoning.
- Mr. Talbott reviewed his company’s parking policy – the parking passes are always in demand.
- Mr. Mickley commented that he could not envision voting to grant a fraternity different rights than any other apartment building, that building could be sold the next month as a rooming house.
- Mr. Talbott discussed his purchase of Fraternity houses in the 1960’s that he flattened and put up apartment buildings.
- Mr. Cavalaris stated that the proposal has been modified from 62 beds to 44 beds since review by the UAC Zoning.
- Mr. Segna commented that the program would be difficult to change to apartments in the future due to the variance process that would be involved.
- Mr. Burn commented that they would not pursue this project if not for the STEP Program. The house requires upgrades for study space.
- Mr. Ferdelman suggested the Applicants discuss their proposal with Campus Partners prior to issuance of their CPD by Council.

motion | **Tabled**

D.

Staff Issued Certificates of Approval

		items approved
1.	10 East 17th Avenue	roof
2.	64 Chittenden Avenue	roof
3.	72 Chittenden Avenue	roof
4.	75 East 18th Avenue	replace stairs
5.	149 East 12th Avenue	roof
6.	175 East Norwich Avenue	siding
7.	240 West 8th Avenue	roof
8.	1560 North High Street	temporary banner – 90° LAB
9.	1797-1799 North 4th Street	roof
10.	1871 North 4th Street	replace stairs, railing, site improvements
11.	2130 Indiana Avenue	siding
12.	2138 North 4th Street	exterior cladding - brick
13.	2661 North High Street	replace cell antenna - Verizon

- Mr. Ferdelman

motion by | **Mr. Talbott / Mr. Mickley**
 10:40 – 10:45
 motion | **To approve the proposal as submitted.**
 vote | **5-0 to Approve**

E.

Board Approved Applications Issued Certificates of Approval

		approved : items approved	COA issued
1.	31-53 East 8th Avenue (SCG South - Building 3)	04/16/2015: site and building	05/14/2015
2.	71-85 East 8th Avenue (SCG South - Building 4)	04/16/2015: site and building	05/14/2015
3.	190 West 8th Avenue (Multi-Family)	02/19/2015: addition	04/22/2015
4.	1437 North High Street (Daredevil Dogs)	04/16/2015: sign	04/22/2015
5.	1437-1439 North High Street (Village Idiot, Signs-Patio)	04/16/2015: signs, patio	04/24/2015
6.	1469 Neil Avenue (Multi-Family)	03/19/2015: addition	04/09/2015
7.	1568 North High Street (WOB)	01/15/2015: exterior alteration, signage	04/10/2015
8.	1770 North High Street (Bullwinkle's - Site)	03/19/2015: storefront, signage	04/10/2015
9.	1918 Indianola Avenue (Alpha Gamma Sigma Fraternity)	04/16/2015: siding	04/28/2015
10.	2471 North High Street (Vapor FI)	04/16/2015: sign	04/27/2015

F.

Next Meeting

1. **Thursday June 18, 2015 | 6:30pm | 2231 North High Street (Northwood & High Building, Room 100)**