



NORTH MARKET PLAN UPDATE 1993

City of Columbus

Mayor Gregory S. Lashutka

Development Department

George J. Arnold, Director

Kathy M. Kerr, Deputy Director

Planning Division

Stephen R. McClary, Administrator

Ken Ferrell, Assistant Administrator

Economic Development Division

Pat Grady, Administrator

Prepared by
Richard C. Davis & Associates for the
Planning Division, City of Columbus
copyright: Richard C. Davis & Associates 1994

TABLE OF CONTENT

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	2
1993 North Market Plan Update: INTRODUCTION	3
HISTORIC PERSPECTIVE TO 1993	6
LAND USE AND CONDITIONS	8
DEVELOPMENT/PRESERVATION OBJECTIVES	9
PARKING AND CIRCULATION	12
STREETSCAPE	15
DESIGN	18
IMPLEMENTATION AND MAINTENANCE	20

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

North Market Commission Task Force:

Timothy Bass
Richard Barnett
Ann Sofios Boeckman
Larry Browne
Edith Holler
Michael Kohr
Elsie Oppenheimer
Nancy Duncan Porter
Patricia Cremean Thackery

Historic Resources Commission:

Timothy Bass
Larry Browne
Beth Fisher
Eugenia Morgan
Doreen Uhas-Sauer

With special thanks to:

Ken Danter, *The Danter Company*
Claire Hazucha, *Convention Facilities Authority*
Michael Paplow, *Feinknopf, Macioce, Schappa*
Kathy Shaw, *Planning Division, City of Columbus*
Diane Cole, *Historic Preservation Officer, Planning Division, City of Columbus*
Cleve Ricksecker, *Short North Business Association*
Maureen Atkinson, *Urban Marketing Collaborative*
Pat Thackery, *North Market Merchants Association*
Traffic Engineering Division, *City of Columbus*

1993 North Market Plan Update: INTRODUCTION

CHANGING TIMES: CHANGING NEEDS

The North Market Plan was begun in 1988 in response to development pressures and decisions affecting the North Market area. The 1989 plan was intended as a guide "for both private and public reinvestment in the North Market area". In 1993, in response to changing circumstances, the North Market Area Commission and the City of Columbus have requested a revised North Market Plan as an updated guide to future public and private activity in the area.

Successes

To a large extent the purposes of the 1989 Plan have been realized:

Most of the **west side of Park Street north of Spruce (517-527 Park Street) has been rehabilitated**, attracting a total of four new businesses. These have been the types of new businesses identified as desirable in the 1989 Plan--i.e., interior design, advertising specialties, landscape architecture, and marketing / public relations.

Two new restaurants opened in 1992 on the west side of High Street across from the new Convention Center (**Barley's Ale House** and the **Japanese Steak House**). A third highly successful Spanish-American and Caribbean restaurant, **Tapatio**, opened in 1992 just south of Spruce on the west side of Park Street (just outside the boundary of the North Market District).

The **North Market has grown to include a total of 29 businesses**, six more than in 1989. The North Market Development Authority is in the process of market, design, and related studies leading to **relocation of the North Market by 1995** to its new home on Park Street, adjacent to the old location.

The new **Greater Columbus Convention Center opened its doors** in March 1993. The new building adds 300,000 new square feet of exhibit space, expecting to attract 1.3 - 1.5 million visitors per year. While not included in the North Market District, the iconoclastic deconstructuralist design of the Convention Center by architects Peter Eisenman and the late Richard Trott attracted nationwide attention to the North Market area.

Completion of **new Greek Orthodox Cathedral of the Annunciation**, whose design was inspired by the St. Sophia Cathedral in Constantinople. Mosaic iconography, stained glass and Grecian marble highlight the interior of the Cathedral, supporting one of the largest mosaic-clad domes and pendentives in the United States, with a diameter of 47 feet. While located adjacent to the North Market district, the new Greek Orthodox Cathedral attracts thousands of worshippers and visitors to the area each year, especially during the annual Greek festival.

The urban environment in which the North Market is located has changed significantly. The new Convention Center will bring in 1.3 - 1.5 million visitors into the area each year. To the immediate south, the expansion of the Nationwide Complex and the new Bureau of Worker's Compensation building continue to reinforce the office market and bring thousands of additional office workers to the area. To the north, the successful redevelopment of the Short North commercial district continues to attract shoppers to a variety of galleries, restaurants and bars.

The architectural environment itself has changed, with the North High Street frontage of the North

Market District now facing the spectacular, iconoclastic facade of the new convention facility.

The institutional environment has changed, with the North Market Commission completing its role and delegating its preservation responsibilities to the Historic Resources Commission.

Disappointments

There have been some setbacks / disappointments:

In 1990 the Northern Hotel was demolished. This opened up a vacant and unused lot at the Spruce Street and High Street intersection, a very visible gateway into the North Market District.

Since its restoration in 1989, the first floor of the Wood Companies' Battleship Building at 444 North Front Street has not been leased. A restaurant was originally sought for the 9,000 square feet on the Front Street / Park Street side of the building. Although business development has occurred on the opposite side of Front / Park Street, and although a very successful restaurant developed in an existing property one block north of the Battleship Building, this site has not yet attracted a business or restaurant tenant. On the positive side, this property will by 1995 be immediately adjacent to the new North Market retail development.

Other properties immediately across from the new Convention Center on North High Street have not yet undergone renovation and in their current condition have not attracted street-level or upper-level uses.

Strategic Issues and Objectives

These changes -- environmental, architectural, and institutional--during the 1993 period raise a number of strategic issues: issues requiring actions or decisions.

These events open up a number of opportunities for future development of the North Market District. Development decisions regarding these strategic issues can best be made with reference to a clear set of long-term strategic objectives for the North Market area. Such objectives should include:

- (1) **Creation of better linkages between the North Market District and adjacent areas** to the north (Victorian Village and the Short North); to the south (the Downtown core); and to the east (to the Convention Center, linked to the Nationwide office complex).
- (2) **Development of vacant parcels within the North Market District**, in a manner consistent with architectural character and proposed uses, as well as development of vacant sites adjacent to the district, including the railroad properties to the south.
- (3) **Improvement of the infrastructure of the district**, particularly by the addition of street trees, screening for surface parking, pedestrian-scale light fixtures, and streetscape improvements to create an atmosphere friendly to pedestrian movement.
- (4) As planning for a possible Multi-Modal Transportation Terminal and a future Light Rail Corridor progresses, focus on **preservation of parking availability and access to businesses** within the core of the District.
- (5) **Identification**, in the long term, **an entity that will serve as a developer and deal-**

maker in the area, particularly to attract an hotel and to construct a parking garage if necessary. Aggressive marketing of the advantages of the North Market location to prospective commercial and/or hotel developers may be one function of such an entity.

- (6) **Identification of an entity that can undertake marketing, promotion, maintenance, and management tasks** on behalf of property owners and businesses.
- (7) **Enactment and implementation of design standards** to preserve and enhance historic and architectural character of the area as development and redevelopment proceed.

In summary, the North Market should develop

- **as a compact mixed-use urban center;**
- **featuring the retail attractions of the historic North Market;**
- **incorporating restaurant and other commercial development opportunities; and**
- **supported by structured public parking and transit links to the rest of the Columbus Community.**

Approach to 1993 Plan Update

Appendix One, 1989 North Market Plan and 1993 Update, presents a side-by-side comparison of the recommendations of the original 1989 Plan and the changes that have been proposed in the 1993 updated Plan. References to page numbers in the original Plan and in the updated Plan have been given wherever possible.

The 1993 updated North Market Plan does not attempt to replicate the organization of the 1989 Plan. The Table of Contents compares the relevant portions of the original Plan with the outline of the updated Plan.

A major deviation from the organization of the 1989 North Market Plan is that the 1993 Plan update does not present separate recommendations for each of six "sub-areas" identified in the 1989 Plan. Given the small scale of the existing North Market District, **land use and parking recommendations are better presented for the North Market District as an integral whole.**

Generally in this document, the "North Market District" refers to that area specified in the 1989 North Market Plan as the official district to be administered by the North Market Commission. "North Market area" refers more generally to the North Market District together with the immediate environs adjacent to the North Market District proper. The immediate area surrounding the North Market District would extend north to Goodale, east to include the Convention Center, and south over the railroad tracks to Nationwide Boulevard.

HISTORIC PERSPECTIVE TO 1993

Public markets have been a part of Columbus history since the founding of the City. The city established its first market in 1816 and built a large Central Market in 1849 at Town and 4th Streets.

In the late nineteenth century, Columbus began to grow out of the current downtown core. The city recognized the need for additional public markets in expanding areas. In 1876, Columbus established the first North Market on the site of the present building. It was soon followed by the East and West Markets. Including the Central location, this four market system effectively served all areas of the city.

By 1919, the system served 250,000 customers per week. The growth of supermarkets and the changing shopping habits of the community resulted in the closing and demolition of all but one market. The North Market has survived and is an important reminder of the tradition of public market facilities in the city.

Historically, Columbus public markets were regulated by city ordinances that established fees, the location of stands, standards for products sold, and many other standards for the running of the market. The regulations were implemented by a Market Master, a city employee who ran the market on a day to day basis.

The North Market provides the same function today that it always has. It provides a space for private vendors to sell meats, produce, bakery, dairy products, flowers and other items to the general public. It also provides an opportunity for farmers to sell directly to the consumer.

The North Market effectively functioned under city control until 1948, when a fire destroyed the market building. The market merchants at that time organized to rebuild and raised funds for the present Quonset hut. From that time on, the market was run by the Merchants' Association who hired the Market Master. The market slowly grew over the years under the guidance of the Merchants' Association.

In 1988, the North Market Development Authority was organized. The Authority controls the market building and is responsible for hiring the Market Master. The Development Authority adopted the goal for the North Market to provide the highest quality products in a shopper-oriented environment by merchants or family businesses. To achieve this goal, the Authority is in the process of market, design and related studies leading to the relocation of the North Market by 1995 to its new home on Park Street, adjacent to the old location

The North Market District is a commercial area whose development paralleled that of the public market. The district began in 1876 when Columbus City Council decided to vacate the Old North Cemetery grounds. The remains were buried elsewhere; a parcel set-aside for a public market and the rest of the area subdivided. The district developed during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. It was a unique mixed-use area that benefited from its proximity to downtown, the railroads, and the Columbus Union.

A number of agricultural implement companies maintained offices and warehouses in the district. The largest example of such a building is the Advanced Thresher Warehouse. The area contained several hotels including the Northern Hotel. Most of the buildings in the district originally included retail uses. A variety of businesses could be found in the district, the largest single group was furniture dealers. An excellent example of this type of structure is the Carlisle Furniture building. Other businesses included restaurants, saloons, clothing stores and hardware dealers.

Originally, many of the buildings in the district were of frame construction. Over time, most of the buildings were replaced with brick structures. The district is characterized by two to five story commercial buildings that share common walls with adjoining buildings. These buildings are embellished with a variety of architectural details including pressed metal and decorative brickwork. The density and scale of the district make it a unique resource.

Efforts to preserve the North Market District began in 1979. At that time, the Columbus Landmarks Foundation began to campaign to save the area. These preservation efforts suffered a major setback in 1980 when the Moneypenny-Hammond Warehouse was demolished. In 1982 the Columbus Landmarks Foundation nominated the district to the National Register of Historic Places. The National Register listing was followed by a nomination to the Columbus Register of Historic Properties in 1984.

City of Columbus involvement with the preservation and redevelopment of the North Market began in 1979 with the joint sponsorship (together with the local chapter of the American Institute of Architects of a design charrette entitled "Architects Go To Market." In the 1980 the Development Department retained a consultant to prepare a redevelopment study for the area. In 1981, the Department further designated the North Market District a Neighborhood Commercial Revitalization Area, enabling businesses and property owners in the area to qualify for special redevelopment loans and grants from the city.

Since the mid-'80's, the North Market area has enjoyed a renaissance of new uses in redeveloped historic structures, including housing, theater, restaurant, retail, and office uses. Since 1983, the Department of Development has applied a total of \$888,000 toward business development and building rehabilitation in the area, of which all but \$6,000 was in the form of development loans.

LAND USE AND CONDITIONS

Since 1989, the properties north of Spruce Street on the west side of Park Street have developed as office / retail uses (505, 515-527 Park Street). Other retail / restaurant development has occurred along High Street in the block south of Spruce. Two new restaurants (Barley's Ale House and the Japanese Steak House) have been added in this block since 1989.

On High Street south of Vine, the exercise equipment store operating in 1989 is now closed and the building is vacant. The only operating business in this block is a pub / restaurant in the most southerly building. The upper story of the building on the Moneypenny-Hammond site, used for parking in 1989, has been removed and the site (still used for parking by the Nationwide Companies) is now only accessible from the Wall Street level south of Vine.

The Northern Hotel, shown in the 1989 Plan as a vacant structure, is now gone. The warehouse use of the buildings west of the existing North Market structure has ceased, pending redevelopment of the site as the new North Market. An outdoor storage site immediately west of the existing Market has been redeveloped since 1989 for off-street metered parking.

Upper-Story Uses

The 1989 Plan also showed upper-story uses for the North Market buildings. There is no longer any upper-story residential use of the buildings west of Park Street, either north or south of Spruce (upper stories of the redeveloped buildings from 505 to 527 Park Street have been used for new office space). The entire building on the southwest corner of Park and Spruce is now vacant. The upper story of the building at Swan and Park remains residential, while the 26 residential units in the Battleship Building (Vine and Front) under construction in 1989, are occupied as of 1993.

Changes in Exterior Conditions 1989-1993

Buildings noted as vacant, boarded-up, and deteriorating in 1989 included the Northern Hotel and the adjacent building north of Spruce on High Street. The Northern Hotel is now demolished, and the condition of the remaining building has not improved.

The retail and office redevelopment mentioned above have significantly upgraded the condition of much of the North Market building stock. The most notable exceptions are, unfortunately, along High Street. The two buildings immediately south of Vine on High Street should be listed as showing poor exterior conditions and deteriorating. The remaining brick building at Swan and High is also in deteriorating condition.

The 1989 Plan noted that the majority of off-street parking spaces in the area were unpaved and unstriped, as well as poorly landscaped or not at all landscaped. Happily, this condition has been largely corrected since 1989. All off-street parking south of Vine Street has been paved, landscaped, and striped. The only unpaved offstreet parking remains in the lot immediately west of the existing North Market building.

The condition of sidewalks along High Street has improved significantly with the completion of the new sidewalks, pedestrian lights, and street trees on both sides of High Street. In the interior of the North Market district, the streetscape awaits the initiation of a planned \$1.3 million program of improvements which will accompany the completion of the redeveloped North Market building and plaza.

DEVELOPMENT/PRESERVATION OBJECTIVES

The following 1993 updates build on several 1989 development objectives regarding design and architecture, housing, retail, and office development.

Landmark Feature

- **Accomplish a "gateway" to the District through a combination of better signage on major arteries leading to the District; unified landscape treatments to provide a sense of "place;" and the possible addition of a landmark signage treatment to identify the redeveloped North Market building.**

The 1989 Plan proposed a "gateway" feature to the North Market District. Since 1989, the site originally proposed for this architectural feature has been redeveloped into a new restaurant at the corner of Spruce and High Streets.

Demolitions

- **Demolition may be considered, but only for the purpose of enabling new development compatible in scale, character, and overall use with the North Market District.**

The 1989 Plan did not support demolitions for new construction. The loss of the Northern Hotel building on High Street, the redevelopment of the North Market and the proposed demolition of the current North Market structure, coupled with the completion of the new Convention Center across High Street, have created opportunities for new development and have also "raised the stakes." That is, while there are greater opportunities for development in the area, these opportunities are matched by potential challenges to preservation of the existing architectural character. Vacant sites in the area, particularly along High Street, will require new development if the North Market District is to regain a commercial role to match its historic importance. However, preserving the character of the North Market area remains as essential in 1993 as it was in 1989.

Housing Development

- **Encourage commercial and residential upper-story redevelopment uses, recognizing however, that commercial office uses of upper floors throughout the North Market District are currently more feasible and more attractive redevelopment options than housing.**

The 1989 Plan showed a preference for housing as the primary upper-story use throughout the District. Experience since 1989 indicates that commercial redevelopment of upper stories has been generally more accepted and more successful throughout the district than residential upper-story redevelopment. Since 1989, there has been

no new residential development in upper stories after the completion of the Battleship Building units. (A proposal has been made for residential development in a building which has been redeveloped at ground level for restaurant use). In contrast, at least three successful commercial renovations of upper stories have been carried out in buildings along Park Street. Generally throughout the downtown, the highest residential rents for new units hover just below the range of \$10.00 per square foot per year, while redeveloped space for commercial uses can command at least \$10.00 and more in the North Market area.

Retail Development

- **While retail first-level uses are encouraged, commercial (office) and service uses should be considered desirable and appropriate for first-level redevelopment.**
- **Park Street and High Street are the most desirable locations for new or redeveloped retail and service uses.**
- **Pedestrian access to retail fronting on High Street is the principal feature that should be enhanced along the Wall Street facades between Spruce and Vine.**

Retail first-floor uses were encouraged in the 1989 Plan as the preferred use throughout the District, while the Plan urged that office commercial development be reserved for upper floors not used for residential. Since then, the District has experienced successful redevelopment of lower-level uses for service, design, and other "creative office" uses.

With the proposed re-opening of the North Market in a new location fronting Park Street, the retail "axis" of the District may actually shift to Park Street from High Street. Retail and service development along Park Street will more likely be oriented to the expanded North Market, and to the customers served by the Market, than to the visitors/conventioners market represented by the expanded Convention Center.

Retail "infill" on High Street would most likely develop as an integral part of new hotel or other commercial development oriented toward the Convention Center. It is unlikely that additional retail will develop in the "interior" of the North Market District between Park and High Streets.

While the 1989 Plan envisioned creating street-level retail activity in the rear of buildings fronting High Street (between Spruce and Vine Streets, on the east side of Wall Street), the 1993 update emphasizes pedestrian access on High.

North Market Retail / Marketing Strategy

A redeveloped North Market is equally important to the future North Market District in the 1993 updated Plan as in the 1989 Plan. The expanded farmers' market proposed in the 1989 Plan is being developed as part of the proposed North Market redevelopment and expansion. The (indoor) year-round North Market will expand from its current number of 30 vendors to approximately 42 vendors in the redeveloped building on Park Street.

It is true in 1993 as in 1989 that **additional retail or restaurant development in the area can augment the offerings of the North Market vendors and build on the "niche" created by the North Market** for fresh produce, ethnic food, and specialty cooking. Just as important is the ability of new retail development to target and expand on the customer base currently served by the North Market. Research carried out by and for the North Market indicates that current customers are generally

- aged 35 to 54
- college educated
- in upper-middle to upper income household brackets
- employed
- without children living at home

This is the target customer base which can support additional retail and restaurant development in the area, together with local area residents living to the east and northeast of the North Market, i.e. in the 43203, 43205, 43211, and 43219 zip code areas).

The 1989 Plan suggested that new retail in the North Market District should target a consumer niche that is "arts-oriented" and which would support the "creative office" market already emerging within the District (generally indicating the advertising, marketing, design, architecture, and publishing professions). In fact, new businesses developing during the 1989-93 period fit this profile. New development that should be attracted to the North Market environment may include such "spin-offs" from the North Market as a fresh seafood restaurant or bakery; kitchenware/cookware; unique home furnishings; and specialty or ethnic restaurants.

Generally, **retail in the North Market area should target a predominantly local consumer market, with merchandise and services targeted to specific local consumer groups.** Appendix Two presents a detailed demographic market analysis for a one and three-mile radius surrounding the North Market area. Over 180,000 people live within a three-mile radius of the North Market, while just over 15,000 live within a one-mile distance. About 80,000 people, or about 28.5% of the workforce within the city of Columbus, work downtown within the innerbelt, within an area easily accessible to the North Market.

Office Development

The 1989 North Market Plan preferred locating office uses on upper floors, with separate access if part of a mixed-use structure (page 15). In addition, the earlier plan favored upper-floor residential, rather than commercial/office, development.

The updated North Market Plan encourages **creative uses of upper floors throughout the District, whether for office, residential, or service uses.** In addition, **commercial/office and service uses are also appropriate for first-floor development,** though retail or restaurant development is certainly preferred along the Park Street and High Street frontages.

The intent of the 1989 Plan to attract commercial tenants oriented to the "creative office" market (advertising, marketing, design, architecture, publishing) has been largely realized.

Cultural Development

The 1989 North Market Plan did not specifically mention cultural development as an objective in the area. However, a number of cultural activities and institutions are located in the District. The Contemporary American Theater Company (CATCO) is located on Park Street north of Spruce, while the Columbus Junior Theater is located in the same block. The Greek Orthodox Cathedral hosts a number of cultural events every year, including the popular Greek Festival held each Labor Day weekend.

In addition, proximity to the Short North commercial district presents opportunities for future joint programming for area-wide cultural and artistic events. Such events can help enhance the attractiveness of the area as a retail destination.

The 1993 updated North Market Plan calls for **promotion of cultural activities within the North Market District, building on the proximity of the Greek Orthodox Cathedral, the Short North, the Greater Columbus Convention Center, and the historic North Market.**

PARKING AND CIRCULATION

Parking

The 1989 North Market Plan called for retaining as much on-street parking as possible, especially for short-term use. The original plan suggested that additional on-street parking might be created by use of slant and head-in parking on the street. The 1989 Plan called for a maximum of two-hour parking for all meters in the area, with two-hour off-street metered parking to supplement on-street parking. By 1993, a surface lot adjacent to the current North Market building on the west side, containing a number of two-hour meters, had been added as proposed. Some twelve-hour metered parking still exists on Park Street north of Spruce.

Traffic engineers have monitored the "paid occupancy" of meters in the area, which is approximately 28 percent on an annual basis. Daily parking rates in off-street lots in the area average about \$2.00 per day. This indicates that while parking is generally available in the North Market area, and relatively inexpensive, parking does become a problem at peak times for the North Market operations. And in particular, the availability of free parking for North Market patrons is an issue which will be addressed in the plans for the redeveloped North Market site.

The 1991 North Market Area Neighborhood Commercial Revitalization Plan, completed in 1991 by Feinknopf Macioce Schappa, Architects, Inc., made a number of points regarding parking in the North Market District:

- actual parking demand may never exceed the approximately 168 spaces available for visitors to the North Market District. Peak demand, especially on Market days and during special events, may exceed supply.
- the District cannot be expected to provide parking beyond its own needs, such as for conventions, special events, or downtown workers.
- the emphasis on parking demand may obscure broader development issues. In the long term, available resources should be used to improve the built fabric of the District rather than to provide parking.
- a study should be initiated which considers and recommends solutions for parking in the context of North Market expansion, Convention Center needs, and downtown parking needs in general.

In fact, the City of Columbus has contracted [as of late 1993] with the Mid-Ohio Regional Planning Commission to undertake a long-term evaluation of downtown parking demand and supply, which the City can use as the basis for future public policy regarding traffic engineering and parking development.

With these recommendations in mind, the 1993 North Market Plan update recommends

- **Better coordinating area parking supply with demand**, utilizing techniques of (a) adjusting meter timing to balance short and longer-term demand [see Feinknopf, Macioce and Schappa recommendations, 1991]; and (b) investigating the potential for a parking validation program, if needed, to increase the supply of "free" parking for retail and restaurant customers within the North Market District.

- **Retaining and improving transit and shuttle connections to downtown and surrounding areas.** Currently, COTA's downtown shuttle service stops on Spruce Street in front of the North Market, making a convenient connection to the downtown core. With the redevelopment of the North Market in the next few years, market merchants may want to consider the possibility of enhancing delivery or even jitney transportation services for North Market customers to better serve their needs.
- Exploring the potential for **utilizing access to a proposed multi-modal transportation facility to enhance parking options** for North Market customers as well as for other area businesses.

The 1989 North Market Plan (page 15) encouraged the development of private or public off-street parking for all new projects or uses. In effect, this recommendation would tend to nullify the North Market District's current status within the downtown special parking ("parking-exempt") district as defined in the Columbus City Code. Within this district, new or expanded uses do not have to provide additional parking; the theory being that in an intensely-developed downtown area, it should not be necessary or even desirable to have to provide the same amount of parking as is required in less-developed, suburban areas. Market forces, rather than regulatory controls, have tended to influence more strongly the provision of parking within the parking-exempt downtown area than elsewhere in the city. Without corresponding controls on demolition of existing structures, this policy has, over time, resulted in a downtown area which is better served with parking (over 68,000 spaces) than most other cities its size. **Therefore, in the 1993 updated Plan, this recommendation has been deleted.**

The 1989 Plan recommended that all off-street parking should be paved, striped, landscaped, and lighted (page 15). This objective had been accomplished as of the end of 1993.

The 1989 Plan further recommended the development of short-term, off-street parking to service the North Market and other retail uses within the District (page 20). This objective will be accomplished as the redevelopment of the new North Market building and the creation of a parking plaza on the site of the existing North Market building are completed.

The 1989 Plan proposed that off-street parking should not be allowed within the High Street sub-area (page 21). The 1993 update recommends that **no additional surface parking except for that adjacent to and intended to serve the redeveloped North Market should be permitted either as an interim or a long-term use throughout the North Market District.** For reasons stated above, the North Market is too compact, too urban, and too dependent on the historic character of existing buildings to allow for the development of additional surface parking within its boundaries.

The 1993 North Market Plan update recognizes that **parking within the North Market area is primarily a problem during North Market peak hours and during special events.** The parking plaza proposed for the redeveloped North Market will provide additional parking options both for North Market shoppers and for off-peak retail and restaurant needs for the District.

In summary, the updated North Market Plan proposes that **expanded parking options created within the North Market District should be targeted to meet parking demand generated by businesses and activities within the North Market area.** If additional structured parking is developed as part of a multi-modal transportation facility adjacent to the North Market District, access to that structure should be maintained, accessible from Red Bird Alley, for the convenience of North Market customers and other patrons of North Market area businesses.

The 1989 North Market Plan recommended certain changes in the existing circulation system. The 1993 updated North Market Plan reflects changes in thinking on the part of City planners and traffic engineers since 1989. The objectives to be served by the vehicle circulation system through the area are to (1) **allow for access to existing businesses for service deliveries;** (2) **enable vehicular access to and from the redeveloped North Market both from Park Street and High Street;** (3) **enhance pedestrian access to and through the area** and (4) **allow for vehicular access to a future parking structure which may be built within, or adjacent to, the area.**

The 1989 Plan recommended that portions of Wall and Vine Streets be open for deliveries only. Based on preliminary plans by the Traffic Engineering Division of the City of Columbus, **Wall Street is to be widened to better enable service deliveries to the rear of buildings fronting High Street. Widening Wall Street will also allow for additional metered parking.** Wall Street should remain two-way from Spruce to Vine, but will remain one-way south from Swan to Spruce. Preliminary plans allow for a loading zone on the east side of Wall Street for service deliveries to businesses there.

With the enhanced pedestrian access through the core of the district which will be provided by the new parking plaza as part of the North Market redevelopment, there seems to be no need to close off east-west vehicular traffic on Vine Street, as recommended in the original 1989 Plan. Space Street, which runs along the west side of the old North Market structure, will be closed and used as part of the proposed parking plaza for the redeveloped North Market. **Both Vine and Spruce Streets should remain two-way streets, open for car and truck traffic from both Park and High Streets.**

The 1989 Plan proposed connecting the western portion of Vine Street with a new north/south street as a vehicular entrance to a proposed parking structure, if that structure were to be located south of Vine Street (page 26). The 1989 Plan also proposed that such a parking structure, if developed, should have multiple access and egress points at different street levels, with downtown, special event, and transport users able to enter and exit from either Front or High Street levels (page 26). The 1993 update carries forward the recommendation that **a new parking garage as part of a multi-modal transportation terminal should have multiple access and egress points at several levels. Access to such a structure from the Vine Street level should be preserved for North Market visitors and patrons of area businesses.**

Both the 1989 North Market Plan and the 1991 Feinknopf, Macioce, and Schappa study recommended a traffic light and crosswalk at High and Spruce Streets. Since then, a survey has been carried out under the supervision of the Traffic and Engineering Division to investigate whether existing vehicular and pedestrian traffic would meet the required State warrants for a traffic light at that location. It will be difficult for existing pedestrian traffic counts across High Street to meet the required warrants at Spruce and High, simply because High Street is already the major traffic arterial through the north part of downtown, and for that reason is not perceived by pedestrians as a secure place to cross. A chicken-and-egg conundrum is inevitable: because the street is not perceived as safe to cross, pedestrian traffic counts are unlikely to ever show large numbers of pedestrians traversing High Street without a crossing signal. **The 1993 updated North Market Plan recommends that some means should be identified and implemented to enhance and protect pedestrian traffic across High Street at Spruce Street, from the Convention Center to the North Market District.**

Finally, traffic engineers of the City of Columbus have identified the potential for direct access from westbound I-670 and the off-ramp to the Convention Center, underneath High Street to the proposed parking structure / transportation terminal. As part of planning for a future parking structure south of Vine Street, further investigation is needed to determine whether sufficient right-of-way is available on the southern end of the Convention Center to complete this connection.

STREETSCAPE

A public commitment to improvement of the streetscape has been the key to revitalizing many of Columbus's older commercial areas. In the 1989 Plan, as in the 1993 updated Plan, streetscape improvements are an essential feature of the future development of the North Market District. The City has programmed \$1.3 million of streetscape improvements for the area, which are scheduled to coincide with the completion of the redeveloped North Market. In addition, improvements to the High Street sidewalk, completed in 1993, added trees and pedestrian light fixtures and generally extended the design of the High Street Improvement Program from Nationwide south to Fulton. In 1991, the North Market Area Neighborhood Commercial Revitalization Plan was completed by Feinknopf Macioce Schappa, Architects to direct the streetscape improvement program. **Recommendations from this 1991 NCR Plan have been incorporated into the 1993 updated North Market Plan.**

Street Plantings and Lighting

At first glance, the commercial buildings fronting each other along both sides of Park Street north of Vine Street through the North Market District do not seem particularly remarkable. What makes this stretch of downtown streetscape particularly noteworthy is that in all of downtown Columbus, there remain very few blocks of traditional storefront facades where both sides of the street are intact.* The 1989 North Market Plan suggested that the relationship of Park Street facades on both sides, north of Spruce Street, should be reinforced with street trees and lighting (page 21). The 1993 Plan Update retains this recommendation, but adds that such **improvements could be extended southward as far as Redbird Alley to enhance the congruity and balance of this stretch of Park Street** (see FMS, 1991, Map 3). However, the Feinknopf, Macioce, Schappa 1991 study recommends that

"no trees should be installed along the west facade of the proposed North Market building because they would impede pedestrian activity and diminish the visual impact of the market building." (FMS, 1991, Recommendation #5).

*Intact facing streetscapes within the downtown core can only be found on East Gay Street between High and Third, on East Main Street between Third and Fourth, and on North High Street between Broad and Gay. There are several other blocks where 19th and early 20th-century facades are intact (such as on South High Street between Main and Mound), but in these cases most or all buildings on the facing block have been demolished.

The 1989 Plan proposed that trees and pedestrian lighting should be located on the most visible and heavily-traveled streets through the District. The 1993 Updated North Market Plan recommends, in line with the 1991 Feinknopf, Macioce, Schappa study, that **street trees should be placed along the perimeter of the District, along Park, Front, and the south side of Swan, as well as along the perimeter of the North Market plaza. No trees should be placed on the west facade of the redeveloped North Market building.**

The 1991 Feinknopf, Macioce, Schappa study recommended that **street lighting should be pedestrian in scale and utilitarian in appearance, preferably recreating earlier industrial design. Pedestrian lighting should frame the North Market redevelopment and should also include locations along**

- the south side of Swan
- the east side of Chicopee Alley (linking Swan and Spruce)
- the east side of Wall Street north of Spruce
- the west side of Wall Street south of Vine.

The 1993 updated North Market Plan approves and repeats this recommendation.

Sidewalks and Street Surfaces

The 1989 North Market Plan recommended that **sidewalks and street surfaces be brought up to standard quality** (page 24). The 1993 Plan Update carries forward this recommendation as well as that of the Feinknopf, Macioce, & Schappa study that **sidewalks in areas targeted for improvement should be paved in concrete; streets should be paved in asphalt. New concrete curbs are needed throughout the District** (FMS, 1991, Recommendation #2).

The Feinknopf, Macioce, Schappa study also proposed that **special paving, such as cobbled granite setts, should be placed at certain street intersections to form crosswalks at entrances to the North Market District** (Spruce at High; Spruce at Park; Vine at High; Vine at Park; and Vine at the proposed North Market plaza). The placement of these special pavement features will depend on the approval and installation of crosswalks at these intersections (see above, "Circulation.") This recommendation is carried forward into the 1993 updated Plan, with the provision that **further analysis must be undertaken regarding crosswalk placement.**

Facades and Graphics

The 1989 North Market Plan recommended upgrading storefronts (page 24) and improving building service entrances (page 24). A set of architectural design guidelines for the North Market is being prepared by the Planning Division of the City of Columbus.

While specific guidelines were not included in the 1989 Plan, the plan recommended that **parking structure facades should respect existing architecture in the District** (page 23). This recommendation is carried forward in the 1993 Update (see "Design," below).

In 1993, the most serious need for storefront and building renovation is on High Street. In spite of the addition of several new restaurants in the 1989-1993 period, several storefronts and buildings remain empty. If it is determined that the conditions leading to the abandonment of these buildings by their owners are unlikely to change in the near future, **the City of Columbus should consider a more proactive development strategy to acquire and rehabilitate these buildings for new uses.**

The 1989 plan also recommended the **creation of uniform graphic standards for the North Market District** (page 24). Such standards will be provided as part of the design guidelines for the area being prepared by the Planning Division of the City of Columbus.

Public Spaces

The 1989 North Market Plan recommended that public funds should be targeted to improvement of right-of-way and public spaces in the area surrounding the North Market (24). A commitment to public improvements has been made as part of the City's Capital Improvements Program, to support and enhance the redevelopment of the North Market. A plan has been prepared to guide these public improvements (see Feinknopf, Macioce, Schappa, 1991).

An outdoor area to serve as an expanded farmers' market and to accommodate parking for North Market shoppers was recommended in the 1989 Plan (page 24). The design of an outdoor space for a new farmers' market and for additional parking is underway as part of the North Market redevelopment process.

The 1989 Plan proposed the development of a pedestrian entrance to the North Market District at Vine and High Streets (page 24). The 1991 Feinknopf, Macioce, Schappa study did not include a special pedestrian entrance for the North Market District at this location. However, the FMS study proposes **low masonry walls allowing outdoor seating on Vine Street** adjacent to the parking/outdoor market area (see FMS, 1991, Recommendation #4). **Revitalization of storefronts at Vine and High Streets will help create pedestrian interest** for this entrance to the North Market District.

The 1989 Plan also suggested a pedestrian and automobile gateway entrance to the North Market at Spruce and High Streets (page 24). At the time, it was thought that the building designated as "non-contributing" on the southwest corner of Spruce and High would be removed, making room for some kind of architectural gateway feature (illustration, page 12). In fact, because this building has been rehabilitated for a new restaurant, the corner did not become vacant. The 1993 update does not recommend a "gateway" feature to the District, though distinctive architectural features on the redeveloped North Market structure and plaza should add visual interest to the area. **Better signage on major arteries leading into the North Market area will also help orient and direct visitors.**

Pedestrian Amenities

Pedestrian access between the "retail core" of the North Market District and the proposed parking structure south of the district boundaries was emphasized in the 1989 Plan. The 1993 updated Plan carries forward the recommendation for **easy pedestrian access to the proposed Multi-Modal Transportation Terminal** on this site.

The 1989 Plan also recommended that the High Street Improvement Program then underway on High Street between Nationwide Boulevard and Fulton Street be extended northward from Nationwide to Goodale (page 24). In fact, many of the features of the improvements along High Street south of Nationwide were replicated in the improvements made along both sides of High Street within the North Market area. Some modifications to the original design were made with the intent of reducing scale and cost of the improvements. For example, sidewalk widths were reduced, and an underground watering system for the street trees was not included in the North Market improvements.

Utilities

In 1989, the intent of the North Market Plan was to remove the electric power, telephone, and other utility lines from overhead and place them underground (page 24) for aesthetic reasons. In 1991, however, the consulting team of Feinknopf, Macioce, Schappa recommended in their Neighborhood Commercial Revitalization study that this item be given low priority among the other revitalization activities to be accomplished. Burial of overhead utilities, in the opinion of the consultants, was

"...not essential to the development of the area nor necessary as a 'defining factor.' Indeed, the overhead wiring is typical of urban commercial areas. Retention of the overhead utilities simply reinforces its essential character."

Typically, the burial of overhead utility lines is undertaken by the utility companies themselves when and where development has created a service demand sufficient to warrant the change. The 1993 updated North Market Plan recommends that burial of overhead utilities should proceed only as future development creates a service volume sufficient for the utility providers to justify it in the normal course of development.

DESIGN

A set of architectural design guidelines for the North Market is being prepared as a separate effort by the Planning Division of the City of Columbus. While specific guidelines were not included in the 1989 Plan, the Plan made recommendations on specific design-related issues. Among these were recommendations that

- **New retail development should be in scale with the existing building mass[ing] and architecture, and sensitive to the general North Market focus and environment** (page 14). This recommendation is carried forward into the 1993 updated Plan.
- **Parking structures should be compatible in scale and character with existing buildings** (page 15); and **parking structure facades should respect existing architecture in the District** (page 23). These recommendations are carried forward into the 1993 Plan, with an updated recommendation that **parking structure or transportation terminal facades within or fronting the district should retain North Market materials (generally brick) and design elements.**
- As noted above ("Streetscape / Facades and Graphics") **uniform graphic standards for the North Market District are recommended**, and will be presented as part of the design guidelines being prepared by the Planning Division. As of 1994, these guidelines will be administered by the Historic Resources Commission.
- Building heights should not exceed those of the tallest existing building in the North Market area (page 18). Over time, and subject to redevelopment influences, this standard is likely to be subject to change. The 1993 Plan Update proposes that **new construction should be compatible, in scale, character, materials, and design features, with North Market District structures.**
- **Desirable heights should be examined as part of area-wide rezoning proposed in the Columbus Comprehensive Plan. Where floor-to-area ratios of new development may exceed those of current building stock, amenities at street level should be sought in compensation.** This approach offers a more flexible strategy for adapting the demands of new development to the scale, character, and architectural constraints of the existing environment.

Demolitions

The 1989 North Market Plan stated that "demolitions for new construction should not be encouraged" (page 13). Since 1989, the major demolition occurring in the North Market District has been that of the Northern Hotel, on High Street north of Spruce. The demolition of a non-contributing building on Vine Street, west of the existing North Market, as well as the demolition of the existing North Market structure itself, are contemplated by 1995 as part of the proposed redevelopment of the North Market and adjacent plaza.

The 1993 updated North Market Plan proposes a change in thinking about the prospect of demolition for the purpose of redevelopment. **Redevelopment of the block of High Street north of Spruce is essential to the future of the North Market District.** Aside from the redevelopment of the North

Market itself, this site is the key remaining development location within the North Market District. **Redevelopment prospects of this site will be significantly enhanced if the entire block from Spruce to Swan can be redeveloped as a single project**, whether for hotel, commercial, residential, or retail/restaurant uses. If this is true, the future of the remaining structure at Swan and High should be reconsidered in the light of the benefits of future development for the District as a whole.

The 1993 North Market Plan Update suggests that while **preserving the character of the North Market District is essential, demolition may be considered only for the purpose of enabling new development compatible in scale, character, and overall use with the North Market District**. Such a policy would allow needed flexibility in planning for the redevelopment of the critical High Street locations. As recommended earlier, (see "Facades and Graphics," above), if it is determined that the conditions leading to the abandonment of High Street buildings by their owners are unlikely to change in the near future, **the City of Columbus should consider a more pro-active development strategy to acquire and rehabilitate these buildings for new uses**.

IMPLEMENTATION AND MAINTENANCE

Architectural Review

The success of the North Market District depends, not on the quality of its Plan, but on the ability of businesses, property owners, and merchants within and around the District to organize to promote, preserve, develop, and maintain their neighborhood. Since the 1980's, the District has benefitted from the work of several organizations, among them the North Market Commission, the North Market Development Authority, and the North Market Merchants Association.

The North Market Commission was established in 1987 by action of the Columbus City Council. It was modeled after other architectural commissions such as the German, Italian, and Victorian Village Commissions. The North Market Commission had preservation of the architectural character of the North Market District as its primary mission. Within this mandate, the Commission was responsible for

- developing architectural guidelines
- approving land use plans for the area
- recommendations concerning proposed variances and rezoning
- architectural review (consideration of Certificates of Appropriateness for improvements and modifications to building exteriors, as well as for demolitions of structures protected by the Commission)

As of the end of 1993, the purposes of the Commission having been fulfilled, the North Market Commission will relinquish its responsibilities to the Historic Resources Commission and will thereupon cease operations. **The Historic Resources Commission (HRC) will discharge the same functions as those carried out by the North Market Commission.** This transfer of functions has been made possible by the HRC's acquisition, in 1993, of the power to review (and to deny) certificates of appropriateness for demolitions.

Capital Improvements

The 1989 North Market Plan stated that the City of Columbus would begin capital improvements programming for the design of public spaces and for right-of-way improvements (page 28). Since 1989, \$1.35 million for capital improvements has been budgeted by the City of Columbus for infrastructure and streetscape improvements in the North Market District. These improvements will be completed to accompany the redevelopment of the North Market building. In addition, sidewalk and other pedestrian improvements have been completed on High Street, extending the design of the High Street Improvement Program northward from Nationwide Boulevard to Goodale.

Zoning

The City of Columbus committed in the 1989 North Market Plan to begin examining zoning code changes to address the regulation of both street-level and upper-floor uses (page 28). Zoning changes for the North Market area should emerge from a redraft of the Zoning Code proposed by the recently-adopted Columbus Comprehensive Plan. Such changes, to improve the North Market District, should

- allow for a creative mix of uses within the District, including upper-level uses within buildings;
- allow for flexibility in height and density for new development, based on street-level amenities provided by that development and the compatibility of new development with desirable North Market uses. Density bonuses for developers

for amenities provided at street level should be considered; and

- **encourage the preservation of historic structures through flexibility on loading, parking, and access requirements.**

Financial Incentives and Public Sector Involvement

The 1989 North Market Plan noted a number of possible financial incentives and public investment mechanisms to stimulate North Market redevelopment (page 28 ff):

- direct financial assistance for private rehabilitation projects;
- real property tax abatement for housing development;
- preservation tax credits;
- physical improvement of public spaces and right-of-way (targeted both at "core" and "High Street" subareas);
- public parking development;
- design services; and
- an assessment district for the construction and maintenance of physical improvements.

Public initiatives have had a significant impact on the redevelopment of the North Market District since 1989. Since 1983, the Department of Development has applied a total of \$888,000 toward business development and building rehabilitation in the area, of which all but \$6,000 was in the form of development loans. This amount could be expected, conservatively, to have leveraged two or three times that amount in private investment.

Since 1993, a year which included the completion of improvements to High Street and the opening of the Convention Center, however, proposed new development in the North Market area has reached a plateau. In addition to those incentives and investment mechanisms listed in 1989, additional progress on rehabilitation and redevelopment of the North Market area may require:

- **City acquisition of specific properties or sites for purposes of redevelopment;**
- **Public and community participation in the planning and development of a proposed Multi-Modal Transportation Terminal in an area immediately adjacent to the North Market District; and**
- **Public participation in an effort to attract a new hotel to a site near the Columbus Convention Center.**

The 1989 North Market Plan alluded to the potential for "creation of an assessment district that would provide funding for construction and maintenance of additional physical improvements." This presupposes the **need for some community-based structure responsible for the general maintenance and upkeep of the improvements to the area's streetscape environment, as well as for the general management and promotion of the District's assets.**

Retail Targeting and Recruitment

The 1989 North Market Plan also recommended a **"retail marketing strategy" to assist in targeting and recruiting of specific retail establishments (page 28)**. This recommendation is carried forward into the 1993 updated Plan, with the clarification that a retail marketing strategy is being developed for and by the North Market Development Authority and the North Market merchants as part of the effort to redevelop the North Market. **A retail marketing strategy focusing on the North Market area may need to be part of a larger, more inclusive study including the core of downtown as well as other downtown commercial areas.** In addition, if there is to be a retail targeting and recruiting strategy, **there must be some corresponding agent or organization able to implement such a strategy.**

Parking

Also identified in the 1989 North Market Plan is the **need for a parking study to include the North Market in the context of the northern sector of downtown (page 28)**. As of 1994, the City of Columbus intends to commission a downtown parking study which should include the needs of the North Market together with those of other downtown neighborhoods and districts.

Redevelopment Role

The 1989 Plan called for the City of Columbus (or Downtown Columbus, Inc., a now-defunct entity) to take a role in identifying purchasers and developers for North Market properties and to help negotiate agreements (page 28). The 1993 Plan updates this recommendation to include **the City of Columbus (or another entity to whom these responsibilities would be assigned) should identify purchasers and developers for North Market District properties and help negotiate agreements.** Likewise, the 1993 updated Plan recommends that **the City of Columbus (or another entity to whom these responsibilities would be assigned) should identify and develop a strategy to purchase key sites for redevelopment within the North Market District.**

Organization and Strategy

The concept and practice of strategic planning assumes an on-going role for an organization or entity which is "at the steering wheel" and able to make mid-course corrections and adjustments in the process of implementation. In the case of the North Market, **this entity could take the form of an organization of property owners, businesses, merchants, and community associations, drawing as well on the participation of the Columbus Convention Center and the City of Columbus.** The functions of such an entity would include

- **on-going strategic planning and input to implementation;**
- **representation of specific community interests;**
- **continuing dialogue regarding issues of common concern.** In a district such as the North Market, these will include **development and redevelopment, maintenance of capital improvements, preservation of the historic assets of the District, and**

promotion of the North Market District and adjacent area as a vital mixed-use center for business, shopping, dining, and entertainment.